



# *PARKS AND RECREATION COMMISSION AGENDA REPORT*

---

MEETING DATE: OCTOBER 27, 2004

ITEM NUMBER:

**SUBJECT: TREE REMOVAL REQUEST – 3135 SUMATRA PLACE**

**DATE: OCTOBER 15, 2004**

**FROM: PUBLIC SERVICES DEPARTMENT, MAINTENANCE SERVICES DIVISION**

**PRESENTATION BY: BRUCE A. HARTLEY, MAINTENANCE SERVICES MANAGER**

**FOR FURTHER INFORMATION CONTACT: BRUCE A. HARTLEY, (714) 754-5123**

---

## **RECOMMENDATION**

It is recommended that the Commission approve the request for the relocation of one (1) City-owned parkway tree located in front of 3135 Sumatra Place, with the condition that if the tree does not survive for one year from the date of transplanting, the property owner shall replace the tree with one twenty-four inch (24”) box-size tree and provide the City with two fifteen gallon-size trees to be planted elsewhere on public property. All relocation, maintenance and mitigation costs to be the responsibility of the property owner.

## **BACKGROUND**

The Maintenance Services Division was contacted by the property owner at 3135 Sumatra Place requesting the removal of the City-owned parkway tree located in the parkway in front of his house.

Jim Ortiz, Acting Senior Maintenance Supervisor, investigated the field conditions and forwarded the information to Joe Bogart, City Arborist. Mr. Bogart made contact with Kelly Lee, one of the property owners to discuss the request. The need for removal of the tree was based on a proposed remodeling project for the property and the subsequent need to relocate a driveway and the tree.

The initial removal request and the subsequent request to relocate the tree requires Parks and Recreation Commission approval to be consistent with the City’s criteria for removal as stated in the “Streetscape and Median Development Standards”. The property owners were informed of the requirement. See Attachment 1.

The City received a letter dated August 31, 2004 from Tim Francis, the property owners’ representative and architect for the proposed remodeling project, requesting the City consider the request to remove the parkway tree located in the public right-of-way in front of the Lee’s home. See Attachment 2. The plans for the project have been submitted to the Development Services Department for consideration.

## **ANALYSIS**

The tree is a Bradford Pear, *Pyrus calleryana* 'Bradfordi'. See Attachment 3. It is the designated City parkway tree for Sumatra Place. The tree is growing in a five-foot (5') wide parkway, which is within the ten-foot (10') wide public right-of-way. The tree is approximately twelve feet (12') in height with a trunk diameter of two inches (2"). The tree is in good health. The tree was pruned last in December 2003.

The removal request is based on a proposed remodeling project that, if approved, will move the location of the existing drive approach on the property approximately thirty-two feet to the south. The location of the proposed drive approach would conflict with the existing parkway tree.

The tree is a good candidate for relocation, as it is fairly young and vigorous. Transplanting a parkway tree has been undertaken in the past to facilitate residential remodeling projects, but only with Commission approval.

The tree does not meet any of the criteria that would support a staff approval of the request.

## **ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED**

1. The Commission could approve the request to remove one (1) City parkway tree located at 3135 Sumatra Place, with the requirement that the tree be relocated within the parkway at that address (City Arborist to determine location) and should the tree not survive for a period of one year from the date of transplant, the tree be replaced in a three-to-one ratio, with one twenty-four inch box-size tree to be replanted on-site, and two (2) fifteen gallon-size trees, to be planted elsewhere on public property as specified in the Streetscape and Median Development Standards. All relocation, maintenance, removal and replacement costs to be paid by the applicant.
2. The Commission could deny the request for the removal of one City parkway tree located at 3135 Sumatra Place. This may require redesign of the house remodel.

## **FISCAL REVIEW**

There would be no fiscal impact as a result of the alternatives provided, as all costs would be the applicant's responsibility. The applicant's costs for transplanting the tree are estimated at \$250. The removal costs are estimated to be approximately \$100, if contracted privately. The retail cost for the three trees required as mitigation, should the tree die, would be approximately \$250, without installation costs included.

## **LEGAL REVIEW**

No legal review is required for this item.

## **CONCLUSION**

The request for removal of a City-owned tree located in the public right-of-way at 3135 Sumatra Place does not meet the established removal criteria as stated in the Streetscape and Median Development Standards. The applicant is requesting removal due to a

proposed residential remodeling project. The Commission has, in the past, approved similar requests with conditions that require the City's tree to be relocated and replaced should it not survive. Therefore, staff recommends approval of the removal request with the with the requirement that the tree be relocated within the parkway at that address (City Arborist to determine location) and should the tree not survive for a period of one year from the date of transplant, the tree be replaced in a three-to-one ratio, with one twenty-four inch box-size tree to be replanted on-site, and two (2) fifteen gallon-size trees, to be planted elsewhere on public property as specified in the Streetscape and Median Development Standards. All relocation, maintenance, removal and replacement costs to be paid by the applicant.

---

BRUCE A HARTLEY  
Maintenance Services Manager

---

WILLIAM J. MORRIS  
Public Services Director

- ATTACHMENTS:
- 1 [Letter from City to Eric & Kelly Lee dated September 9, 2004](#)
  - 2 [Letter to City from Tim Francis, Architect dated August 31, 2004](#)
  - 3 [Photographs of Tree](#)

C: Eric & Kelly Lee  
3135 Sumatra Place  
Costa Mesa, CA 92627

Tim Francis  
Pacific Coast Architects  
2600 Newport Blvd., Suite 114  
Newport Beach, CA 92663