



PARKS AND RECREATION COMMISSION AGENDA REPORT

MEETING DATE: MAY 23, 2012

ITEM NUMBER: 9d

SUBJECT: TREE REMOVAL REQUEST – 1601 PONDEROSA STREET

DATE: MAY 16, 2012

FROM: PUBLIC SERVICES DEPARTMENT / MAINTENANCE SERVICES DIVISION

PRESENTATION BY: BRUCE A. HARTLEY, MAINTENANCE SERVICES MANAGER

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION CONTACT: BRUCE A. HARTLEY AT (714) 754-5123

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Deny the request to remove a Southern Magnolia tree growing in the public right-of-way at 1601 Ponderosa Street.

BACKGROUND

On April 16, 2012, the Maintenance Services Division received a request from Jeff Mathews, Parks and Recreation Commissioner, to have staff evaluate a parkway tree located at 1601 Ponderosa Street. A resident had contacted Mr. Mathews regarding the tree; inquiring whether the tree may be removed to prevent some potential problems with adjacent sidewalks and utilities.

ANALYSIS

On April 18, 2012, the City Arborist evaluated the tree and the surrounding hardscape. The tree is a Southern Magnolia, *Magnolia grandiflora*. It is twenty-five feet (25') in height with a trunk diameter of thirteen inches (13"). It is growing to one side of the driveway in a five foot (5') wide parkway adjacent to a four foot (4') wide sidewalk. The tree is fair condition; it is not particularly vigorous or attractive. The tree is located three feet (3') from the drive approach and six feet (6') from the water meter. The curb, gutter, drive approach and a portion of the sidewalk have been replaced sometime in the past. The trunk of the tree shows signs of mechanical damage, possibly from an axe or hatchet. Nails have been driven into the trunk and limbs. The tree does not meet removal criteria nor does it require trimming. See attachments 1 and 2.

There is second parkway tree growing in the public right of way at this address. It is a Bradford Pear, *Pyrus calleryana* 'Bradfordii'. The tree is twenty feet (20') in height with a trunk diameter of eleven inches (11"). It is growing more towards the center of the property in a five foot (5') wide parkway adjacent to a four foot (4') wide sidewalk. The tree appears slightly stressed. The trunk of the tree shows signs of mechanical damage, possibly from an axe or hatchet. Nails have been driven into the trunk and limbs. The tree was planted in a full root barrier. The curb and gutter have been replaced in the past. A raised portion of the sidewalk has been ground. Christmas lights

have been placed in the canopy of the tree. The tree does not need trimming at this time and does not meet removal criteria.

While inspecting the trees, the City Arborist spoke with one of the residents who stated that their concern is with the potential for the Magnolia tree to fall on their travel trailer which is stored in the front yard of the home. A search of public records indicated the property owner is Anthony Deniger. The resident's name is Bruce Plummer. It is unknown who is the actual property owner.

Both trees are safe, with no apparent hazards present. They are not adversely impacting any curb, gutter, sidewalk or underground utilities. There are no other issues with the trees, such as power lines or other obstructions. The Magnolia tree would not be a good candidate for transplanting, as it would require extensive removal of the concrete around it at a significant replacement cost. Magnolia trees are difficult to transplant successfully; and since this particular tree is not in a vigorous condition, it is not recommended.

The Magnolia tree does not meet the criteria for a Category 1 - 'Health and Safety' removal and is not considered a Category 2 - 'problem tree species.'

The Applicant has been notified of the meeting and has been sent a copy of the agenda and this report.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED

The Commission could authorize the removal and replacement of the tree, per the Streetscape and Median Development Standards, Section 4.0.3 – Discretionary Removals, which would require the replacement of the tree with one (1) twenty-four inch box-size tree and two (2) fifteen gallon-size trees to be planted elsewhere on City property. The applicant would pay all removal and replacement costs.

If approved by the Commission, the tree must be removed and mitigation trees provided to the City within one year from the date of final approval, after which the approval expires.

FISCAL REVIEW

There would be no fiscal impact to the City if the request to remove the tree was either denied or if it is approved as a Discretionary Removal, as the applicant would pay all costs.

For the Commission's information the cost for the removal of the tree would be \$201.50. The cost for the replacement (mitigation trees) would be \$306. These costs are based on current City contract prices. Total cost for removal and mitigation trees would be \$507.50

LEGAL REVIEW

No legal review is required for this item.

CONCLUSION

The Southern Magnolia tree growing in the public right-of-way at 1601 Ponderosa Street is not currently causing any observable damage to either public or private property. It does not meet the criteria required to allow for staff to approve its removal. The basis of the request appears to be related to a concern for the structural integrity of the tree and the potential for damage to a recreational vehicle parked nearby. Lacking any substantive reasons as a basis for removal, staff recommends that the Commission deny the request.

BRUCE A. HARTLEY
Maintenance Services Manager

ERNESTO MUNOZ
Public Services Director

ATTACHMENTS: 1. [Tree Information](#)
 2. [Photographs](#)

C: Bruce Plummer
 1601 Ponderosa Street
 Costa Mesa, CA 92626

 Anthony Deniger
 1601 Ponderosa Street
 Costa Mesa, CA 92626