



PARKS AND RECREATION COMMISSION AGENDA REPORT

MEETING DATE: MAY 23, 2013

ITEM NUMBER: 9c

SUBJECT: TREE REMOVAL REQUEST - 3126 CORK LANE

DATE: MAY 13, 2013

FROM: PUBLIC SERVICES DEPARTMENT, MAINTENANCE SERVICES DIVISION

PRESENTATION BY: BRUCE A. HARTLEY, MAINTENANCE SERVICES MANAGER

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION CONTACT: BRUCE A. HARTLEY (714) 754-5123

RECOMMENDATION

Deny the request for the removal of three City-owned parkway trees located in the public right-of-way at 3126 Cork Lane.

BACKGROUND

The Maintenance Services Division was originally contacted by the Applicant on January 4, 2013 requesting that the City remove and replace the three City owned trees growing in the parkway in front and on the side of the property. The City Arborist inspected the trees on January 8, 2013. The trees did not meet Category 1 or 2 removal criteria. The Applicant was informed of that decision. The Applicant contacted the Maintenance Services Manager via electronic mail requesting further review of the request. See Attachment 1. Following the inspection by the Maintenance Services Manager, the trees were evaluated by the Public Services Director and the determination was made to forward the request to the Parks and Recreation Commission for consideration.

The Applicant listed the following issues with the trees:

- The trees drop "huge pine cones that are a hazard and a nuisance to clean up".
- "The side parkway tree is buckling the street and curb".

ANALYSIS

The City Arborist evaluated the three trees, Southern Magnolia, *Magnolia grandiflora*, finding them to be healthy and in fair condition. The trees appear to be over-pruned, resulting in few lower branches, fairly thin canopies and visible adventitious growth along the branches. This is not the typical pruning style performed by the City's contractor. This type of pruning, which removes more than the typical 10-15% of the foliage, may explain the less than vigorous condition of the trees.

The trees are designated as F1 – the tree located in front of the home on Cork Lane. S2 – the first tree located on the side of the property going east on McCormack. S1 – the second tree located on the side of the property going east on McCormack.

F1: The tree is approximately forty feet (40') in height, with a trunk diameter of fifteen inches (15"). This tree was previously root pruned with the adjacent sidewalk lift ground smooth. No significant concrete damage was observed.

S1: The tree is approximately forty-five feet (45') in height, with a trunk diameter of sixteen inches (16"). The roots on the sidewalk side of this tree were pruned at the time the sidewalk was replaced. The sidewalk is currently safe for pedestrian travel.

S2: The tree is approximately forty feet (40') in height, with a trunk diameter of twenty-two inches (22"). The roots on the sidewalk side of this tree were pruned at the time the sidewalk was replaced. The sidewalk is currently safe for pedestrian travel. The curb and gutter are becoming displaced due to root growth. The roots of the tree extend out into the street and are causing uplifted asphalt over a very large area. These roots would be removed at the time the street is rehabilitated. Root pruning is not a viable maintenance option at this time due to the root cutting that occurred for the reconstruction of the sidewalk.

All of the trees are located in five foot (5') wide turf parkways adjacent to a four foot (4') wide sidewalk. The aerial portions of the three trees were last pruned on January 3, 2012, by the City's tree maintenance contractor. See Attachment 2.

At the time of inspection, no leaf, flower or fruit litter was observed.

The trees do not meet the criteria for a staff level authorization for removal, as stated in the Streetscape and Median Development Standards. The City Arborist evaluated the trees for possible relocation, but believes that due to the cost of relocating the trees being greater than the value of the tree, and the low success rate of relocating Magnolia trees, relocation is not recommended. The Public Services Director reviewed the trees and determined that since the only damage attributable to the trees is the asphalt, curb and gutter, which would be repaired in the future during renovation of the street, he would not authorize the removal of the three trees.

The Applicant has been notified of the Parks and Recreation Commission meeting and has been sent a copy of this staff report.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED

The Commission could authorize the removal and replacement of the trees, per the Streetscape and Median Development Standards, Section 4.0.3 – Discretionary Removals, which would require the replacement of the trees with three (3) twenty-four inch box-size trees (one for each tree removed) to be planted at the same address and six (6) fifteen gallon-size trees (two for each tree removed) to be planted elsewhere on City property. The applicant would pay all removal and replacement costs.

If approved by the Commission, the tree must be removed and mitigation trees provided to the City within one year from the date of final approval, after which the approval expires.

FISCAL REVIEW

There would be no fiscal impact to the City if the request to remove the tree was either denied or approved as a Category 3; Discretionary Removal, as the applicant would pay all costs.

For the Commission's information, the cost for the removal of the three (3) trees would be \$1,060. The replanting costs for the mitigation trees (3 – 24" box size and 6 – 15 gallon size) would be \$1,275. Costs are based on current City contract prices. Total cost for removal and replacement would be \$2,335.

LEGAL REVIEW

No legal review is required for this item.

CONCLUSION

The three parkway trees that have been requested to be removed are located within the public right-of-way in the front and to the side of 3126 Cork Lane. The trees are healthy and in fair condition. The Applicant states that the trees drops cones that are a hazard and are a nuisance to clean up, and are causing curb, gutter and roadway damage. Staff found the impacts attributable to the trees are primarily to the curb, gutter and roadway and could be repaired appropriately with future street maintenance projects. It is therefore recommended that the Commission deny the Applicant's request for removal of the three City parkway trees.


BRUCE A. HARTLEY
Maintenance Services Manager


ERNESTO MUNOZ
Public Services Director

ATTACHMENTS: 1. E-mail from Applicant requesting removal of parkway tree
2. Tree Information
3. Photographs

C: Shaun Stellman
3126 Cork Lane
Costa Mesa, CA 92626

HARTLEY, BRUCE**Subject:** FW: Parkway Trees - 3126 Cork Lane

From: Shaun Stellman [mailto:sstellman@hubgroup.com]
Sent: Tuesday, April 02, 2013 2:33 PM
To: HARTLEY, BRUCE
Subject: Re: Parkway Trees - 3126 Cork Lane

Mr Hartley,

Thanks again for taking the time to stop by and assess the parkway trees surrounding our house. I would prefer to remove all three trees. Please provide instructions on the subsequent actions required for review by the Parks and Recreation Commission this month.

Thank you!!

Shaun Stellman | Director - Intermodal Operations - West Region | The Hub Group, Inc.
 3075 Imperial Parkway Suite 100 | Brea, CA 92821 | Tel 714-577-3212 | Cell 714-317-6409
 ✉ sstellman@hubgroup.com | 🌐 www.hubgroup.com

From: "HARTLEY, BRUCE" <BRUCE.HARTLEY@costamesaca.gov>
 To: Shaun Stellman/The Hub Group Inc.@HubGroup
 Date: 03/28/2013 03:38 PM
 Subject: Parkway Trees - 3126 Cork Lane

Good Afternoon Mr. Stellman,

I stopped by on Monday and looked at the three Magnolia trees in the front and on the sides of your house. Although I agree with Dan Dominguez' assessment that the trees don't appear to meet the Category 1 removal criteria, I do understand your concerns that they have the potential to cause more of the problems you are observing. The tree in front does not appear to be causing any serious concrete damage issues at this time; I believe root pruning and root barriers would prevent any significant concrete damage for several years. However, the larger Magnolia on the side of the property is certainly causing significant problems with the pavement and is beginning to cause damage to concrete that appears to have been replaced before. Root pruning could be performed on either the sidewalk side or the street side, but not both due to concerns for the stability of the large tree afterwards. This tree may meet Category 2 removal criteria, but I would like the Public Services Director to take a look and perhaps approve that, which would avoid going to the Parks and Recreation Commission for determination. The smaller Magnolia on the side of the property could be managed utilizing root pruning and root barriers in my opinion to prevent concrete and asphalt damage.

If you would prefer to take all three of the trees out, we could take them to the Parks Commission in April. If you would like to wait and see what the Director says about each one, then I will schedule time with him out there next week and see what he thinks after he has looked at them in person.

04/12/2013

**City of Costa Mesa
Maintenance Services Division
FIELD INSPECTION – TREE INFORMATION**

ATTACHMENT #2

Denial <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Category 1 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	2 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	3 <input type="checkbox"/>
Supporting <input type="checkbox"/>	Category 1 <input type="checkbox"/>	2 <input type="checkbox"/>	3 <input type="checkbox"/>

Date Request Received: 4/3/2013

Name of Resident: Shaun Stellman Requesting Party: _____

Address: 3126 Cork Lane Address: _____

Home Phone: 714-577-3212 Home Phone: _____

Work Phone: _____ Work Phone: _____

Date Inspected: 4/3/2013

Inspected By: Daniel Dominguez III – Interim City Arborist

Parkway Maintenance Report:

Tree Species: Magnolia grandiflora F1 Removal Cost: (DBH x \$20.00)= \$ 300.00

Height: 40 Feet Width of Sidewalk: 4 Feet

Trunk Diameter: 15 Inches Size of Right-of-Way: 10 Feet

Health: Good Fair Poor Date of Last Pruning: 1/03/2012

Is the Tree a good candidate for Relocation? Yes No

Likelihood of survival: Good Fair Poor

Comments: This tree is mature and would require an overly large box to accommodate the root system. Curb, gutter, street and sidewalk would have to be removed and replaced. Estimated tree value \$4,890.00

Concrete Damage: Yes No

If Yes, describe damage: **Lifting of sidewalk panel. Panels have been shaved down, no trip hazard at this time.**

Can the Tree be Root Pruned: Yes No Date: _____

Root Pruning Comments: **Tree can be root pruned on the sidewalk side.**

Date of Response to Resident: _____

Date Information Packet Mailed: _____

Photos Taken: Yes No Date Photos Taken: 4/03/2013

Photo #1: Street view looking east

Photo #2: Street view looking north

Photo #3: Street view looking south

Photo #4: Base of the tree

[home](#)

[methodology](#)

[help](#)

[sign
off](#)

Inventory Detail Search Results

Dist: 6
 Address: 3126 CORK LN
 Fictitious: No
 Location: Front-1
 On Address: 3126 CORK LN
 Species: Magnolia grandiflora, SOUTHERN MAGNOLIA
 DBH/Height: 13-18 / 15-30
 Parkway Size: 5
 Utility Overhead: No
 Maintenance: Grid Trim
 Valid Site: Yes
 Estimated Value \$4,890
 Map: [show map and 360° panorama](#)
 Condition: Good
 Removal Priority: N/A
 Parkway Type: Parkway

[update](#) [view/add notes](#) [work order](#) [view/add pictures](#) [print](#)

WCA Work History

Date	Work Type	Amount	Job#	Species (if removed)
1/3/2012	Grid Pruning	\$46.60	19252	
3/24/2009	Grid Pruning	\$46.60	12656	
8/31/2006	Grid Pruning	\$41.50	9754	
5/5/2003	Grid Trimming	\$41.50	5259	

Other Work History

Date	Work Type	Crew	Acct#	Min
------	-----------	------	-------	-----

[create new work history](#)



[ArborAccess Beta](#)

[View Eval Removals](#)

[Email your Area Manager and CSR](#)

[View sent Email Messages](#)

[View WCA Phone Directory](#)

[View Specialty Tree Planting Stock](#)

[View 360° Panorama Street View](#)

[View Grant Opportunities](#)

**City of Costa Mesa
Maintenance Services Division
FIELD INSPECTION – TREE INFORMATION**

Denial	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Category	1 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	2 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	3 <input type="checkbox"/>
Supporting	<input type="checkbox"/>	Category	1 <input type="checkbox"/>	2 <input type="checkbox"/>	3 <input type="checkbox"/>

Date Request Received: 4/3/2013

Name of Resident:	<u>Shaun Stellman</u>	Requesting Party:	_____
Address:	<u>3126 Cork Lane</u>	Address:	_____
Home Phone:	<u>714-577-3212</u>	Home Phone:	_____
Work Phone:	_____	Work Phone:	_____

Date Inspected: 4/3/2013
 Inspected By: Daniel Dominguez III – Interim City Arborist
 Parkway Maintenance Report:

Tree Species:	<u>Magnolia grandiflora S2</u>	Removal Cost: (DBH x \$20.00)= \$ <u>440.00</u>
Height:	<u>40 Feet</u>	Width of Sidewalk: <u>4 Feet</u>
Trunk Diameter:	<u>22 Inches</u>	Size of Right-of-Way: <u>10 Feet</u>

Health: Good Fair Poor Date of Last Pruning: 1/03/2012

Is the Tree a good candidate for Relocation? Yes No

Likelihood of survival: Good Fair Poor

Comments: **This tree is mature and would require an overly large box to accommodate the root system. Curb, gutter, street and sidewalk would have to be removed and replaced. Estimated tree value \$9,110.00**

Concrete Damage: Yes No

If Yes, describe damage: **Displacement of the curb. Sidewalk panel replaced in the past, no trip hazard at this time.**

Can the Tree be Root Pruned: Yes No Date: _____

Root Pruning Comments: **The tree was previously root pruned. Root pruning along curb may impact stability of the tree.**

Date of Response to Resident: _____

Date Information Packet Mailed: _____

Photos Taken: Yes No Date Photos Taken: 4/03/2013

Photo #1: Street view looking north
 Photo #2: Street view looking west
 Photo #3: Street view looking east
 Photo #4: Base of the tree

[home](#)

[methodology](#)

[help](#)

[sign
off](#)

Inventory Detail Search Results

Dist: 6
 Address: 3126 CORK LN
 Fictitious: Yes
 Location: Side-2
 On Address: 1222 MCCORMACK LN
 Species: Magnolia grandiflora, SOUTHERN MAGNOLIA
 DBH/Height: 19-24 / 15-30
 Parkway Size: 5
 Utility Overhead: No
 Maintenance: Grid Trim
 Valid Site: Yes
 Estimated Value: \$9,110
 Map: [show map and 360° panorama](#)
 Condition: Good
 Removal Priority: N/A
 Parkway Type: Parkway

WCA Work History

Date	Work Type	Amount	Job#	Species (if removed)
1/3/2012	Grid Pruning	\$46.60	19252	
3/23/2009	Grid Pruning	\$46.60	12656	
9/1/2006	Grid Pruning	\$41.50	9754	
5/5/2003	Grid Trimming	\$41.50	5259	

Other Work History

Date Work Type Crew Acct# Min



[ArborAccess Beta](#)

[View Eval Removals](#)

[Email your Area Manager and CSR](#)

[View sent Email Messages](#)

[View WCA Phone Directory](#)

[View Specialty Tree Planting Stock](#)

[View 360° Panorama Street View](#)

[View Grant Opportunities](#)

**City of Costa Mesa
Maintenance Services Division
FIELD INSPECTION – TREE INFORMATION**

Denial	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Category	1 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	2 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	3 <input type="checkbox"/>
Supporting	<input type="checkbox"/>	Category	1 <input type="checkbox"/>	2 <input type="checkbox"/>	3 <input type="checkbox"/>

Date Request Received: 4/3/2013

Name of Resident:	<u>Shaun Stellman</u>	Requesting Party:	_____
Address:	<u>3126 Cork Lane</u>	Address:	_____
Home Phone:	<u>714-577-3212</u>	Home Phone:	_____
Work Phone:	_____	Work Phone:	_____

Date Inspected: 4/3/2013
 Inspected By: Daniel Dominguez III – Interim City Arborist
 Parkway Maintenance Report:

Tree Species:	<u>Magnolia grandiflora S1</u>	Removal Cost: (DBH x \$20.00)= \$ <u>320.00</u>
Height:	<u>45 Feet</u>	Width of Sidewalk: <u>4 Feet</u>
Trunk Diameter:	<u>16 Inches</u>	Size of Right-of-Way: <u>10 Feet</u>

Health: Good Fair Poor Date of Last Pruning: 1/03/2012

Is the Tree a good candidate for Relocation? Yes No

Likelihood of survival: Good Fair Poor

Comments: **This tree is mature and would require an overly large box to accommodate the root system. Curb, gutter, street and sidewalk would have to be removed and replaced. Estimated tree value \$4,890.00**

Concrete Damage: Yes No

If Yes, describe damage: **Lifting of sidewalk panel. Panels have been shaved down, no trip hazard at this time.**

Can the Tree be Root Pruned: Yes No Date: _____

Root Pruning Comments: **Tree can be root pruned on the sidewalk side.**

Date of Response to Resident: _____

Date Information Packet Mailed: _____

Photos Taken: Yes No Date Photos Taken: 4/03/2013

- Photo #1: **Street view looking north**
- Photo #2: **Street view looking west**
- Photo #3: **Street view looking east**
- Photo #4: **Base of the tree**

[home](#)

[methodology](#)

[help](#)

[sign
off](#)

Inventory Detail Search Results

Dist: 6
 Address: 3126 CORK LN
 Fictitious: Yes
 Location: Side-1
 On Address: 1222 MCCORMACK LN
 Species: Magnolia grandiflora, SOUTHERN MAGNOLIA
 DBH/Height: 13-18 / 15-30
 Parkway Size: 5
 Utility Overhead: No
 Maintenance: Grid Trim
 Valid Site: Yes
 Estimated Value \$4,890
 Map: [show map and 360° panorama](#)
 Condition: Good
 Removal Priority: N/A
 Parkway Type: Parkway



[ArborAccess Beta](#)

[View Eval Removals](#)

[Email your Area
Manager and CSR](#)

[View sent Email
Messages](#)

[View WCA Phone
Directory](#)

[View Specialty Tree
Planting Stock](#)

[View 360° Panorama
Street View](#)

[View Grant
Opportunities](#)

WCA Work History

Date	Work Type	Amount	Job#	Species (if removed)
1/3/2012	Grid Pruning	\$46.60	19252	
3/23/2009	Grid Pruning	\$46.60	12656	
9/1/2006	Grid Pruning	\$41.50	9754	
5/5/2003	Grid Trimming	\$41.50	5259	

Other Work History

Date Work Type Crew Acct# Min









