



PARKS AND RECREATION COMMISSION AGENDA REPORT

MEETING DATE: JULY 25, 2013

ITEM NUMBER: 9a

SUBJECT: TREE REMOVAL REQUEST - 2737 CARDINAL DRIVE

DATE: JULY 11, 2013

FROM: PUBLIC SERVICES DEPARTMENT, MAINTENANCE SERVICES DIVISION

PRESENTATION BY: BRUCE A. HARTLEY, MAINTENANCE SERVICES MANAGER

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION CONTACT: BRUCE A. HARTLEY (714) 754-5123

RECOMMENDATION

Deny the request for the removal of one City-owned parkway tree located in the public right-of-way at 2737 Cardinal Drive.

BACKGROUND

The Maintenance Services Division was initially contacted by the Applicant in October 2011 requesting the City remove and replace the parkway tree due to sewer issues. At that time, the Arborist evaluated the request, inspected the tree and the adjacent property. Due to several on-site trees and no video inspection of the sewer lateral provided, the request was denied. On May 24, 2013 the Applicant again contacted the City regarding the tree and provided a DVD documenting the inspection of the sewer lateral.

ANALYSIS

The City Arborist inspected the tree, a Canary Island Pine, *Pinus canariensis*, on May 29, 2013, and found it to be in good condition. It is approximately forty-five feet (45') in height with a trunk diameter of nineteen inches (19"). It is growing adjacent to a four foot (4') wide sidewalk. The public right of way width at that location is ten feet beyond the road edge. The tree was pruned last on July 12, 2012. The Arborist noted a cracked and displaced curb and gutter with a 1.5 inch sidewalk lift south of the tree.

The original sewer inspection DVD provided by the Applicant showed significant root intrusion which the Arborist attributed to several private trees in the landscape surrounding the residence. In the absence of footage markers on the video, no reliable determination could be made at that time of whether any of the root intrusion was from the City's parkway tree. A second inspection was performed, entering from a clean-out installed near the house. The Arborist reviewed the second DVD of the sewer lateral inspection performed and noted that the line had been cleaned and no roots were visible. The only documentation provided of root intrusion was provided in a photograph provided by the Costa Mesa Sanitary District (CMSD) that was taken at the time the main sewer line was cleaned and inspected. This photograph documented root intrusion approximately twenty to thirty feet (20-30') from the tree in the roadway near the location where the lateral line meets the main sewer line.

With the lateral line located further than fifteen feet (15') from the City tree and no clear evidence that the tree roots were from the parkway tree, there was insufficient justification for staff to approve the removal. Typically, if the sewer lateral is not within ten feet (10') of the City parkway tree, the criteria have not been met for a Category 1 removal authorization. The sewer lateral location was determined by maps provided by the CMSD. The Applicant states that the plumber believed the lateral to be within eight feet (8') of the tree.

There is no disputing that there were roots in the sewer line. What staff was unable to determine with sufficient certainty was whether the roots are attributable to the parkway tree and what the actual distance was from the lateral to the tree.

The tree does not meet the criteria for a staff level authorization for removal, as stated in the Streetscape and Median Development Standards. The City Arborist evaluated the tree for possible relocation, but believes that due to the large size of the tree and the high cost of relocating it, relocation is not recommended. The tree does not meet Category 1 or 2 removal criteria. The Applicant was informed of that decision and was provided the removal criteria.

The Applicant has been notified of the Parks and Recreation Commission meeting and has been sent a copy of this staff report.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED

1. The Commission could authorize the removal and replacement of the tree, per the Streetscape and Median Development Standards, Section 4.0.3 – Discretionary Removals, which would require the replacement of the tree with one (1) twenty-four inch box-size tree to be planted at the same address and two (2) fifteen gallon-size trees to be planted elsewhere on City property. The applicant would pay all removal and replacement costs.

If approved by the Commission, the tree must be removed and mitigation trees provided to the City within one year from the date of final approval, after which the approval expires.

2. The Commission could authorize the removal of the tree as a Category 1 – 'Health and Safety' removal with all removal and replacement costs paid for by the City.

FISCAL REVIEW

There would be no fiscal impact to the City if the request to remove the tree was either denied or approved as a Category 3; Discretionary Removal, as the applicant would pay all costs.

For the Commission's information, the cost for the removal of the tree would be \$380. The replanting costs for the mitigation trees (1 – 24" box size and 2 – 15 gallon size) would be \$425. Costs are based on current City contract prices. Total cost for removal and replacement would be \$805. The value of the tree is estimated to be \$4,890.

LEGAL REVIEW

No legal review is required for this item.

CONCLUSION

The City-owned street tree that has been requested to be removed is located within the public right-of-way at 2737 Cardinal Drive. The tree is in good condition. The Applicant is experiencing sewer issues caused by root intrusion and is requesting removal of the parkway tree.

The lateral is not within the ten foot radius of the parkway tree that is typically required to meet the City's criteria for a Category 1 removal. The City Arborist determined that the tree is in good condition and root pruning will not resolve sewer issues. There is root intrusion into the lateral line in the street. However, lacking definitive justification as a basis for removal, staff recommends that the Commission deny the request.


BRUCE A. HARTLEY
Maintenance Services Manager


FOR: ERNESTO MUNOZ
Public Services Director

ATTACHMENTS: 1. Letter, invoice and photograph from Applicant
2. Tree Information and Work Orders
3. Photographs

C: Thomas Lightvoet
2737 Cardinal Drive
Costa Mesa, CA 92626

May 21, 2013

Mr. Bruce Hartley, Maintenance Manager
City of Costa Mesa
2310 Placentia
Costa Mesa, CA 92626

Dear Mr. Hartley,

Following up on my letter to you dated October 26, 2011 and a conversation that we had in late 2012, I am writing to update you on our most recent difficulties with our sewer line being clogged by a roots from a pine tree planted by the City at our curb.

A couple months ago we had another event with the line backing up waste into our downstairs bathroom. Since we had the plumber out fairly recently to use a roter on the line, this time I contacted the Costa Mesa Sanitary District about the problem. They provided me with a list of plumbing contractors that might be able to resolve our problem. After interviewing four companies, one of which provided us with the enclosed DVD showing the root incursion before any work was done. We then hired Roto-Rooter to put in a two-way access in the front yard.

The video that was taken before the work was done indicated some minor root intrusions and one major root intrusion near the main sewer line in the street that they could not break through to complete the last couple of feet of video showing the end of the line. However, I have also enclosed a picture taken eighteen months ago by the CM Sanitary District. It was taken looking from the main line looking at the juncture where our line meets the main line. It shows how much the end of our line was clogged even after a plumber had used a traditional roter to clean out the line a month earlier.

Once Roto-Rooter completed the installation of a two-way cleanout access in our front yard we also had them hydro-jet the lines both toward the house and out toward the main sewer line. I have also proved you with a copy of the Roto-Rooter DVD which was taken after their work was done. It shows how clean our line is now that the tree roots were cleaned out. Obviously they will grow back again.

Roto-Rooter's assessment of the major root intrusion near the main sewer line was that the pine tree in our front yard, which stands eight feet from our sewer line, was undoubtedly the problem. The total invoiced amount from Roto-Rooter came to \$1,800.

I am not asking the city for reimbursement for the work that was done but I am once again requesting that the City of Costa Mesa remove the pine tree. Also, a portion of the sidewalk was replaced a few years ago due to the roots lifting it up and creating a safety hazard. It is raised again and should be replaced once the tree is removed.

Thank you for your prompt attention to this matter.

Sincerely,



Thomas Lightvoet, 2737 Cardinal Drive, Costa Mesa, CA 92626

COSTA MESA
CARDINAL ST

101817 -> 101798
VCP Vitrified Clay Pipe, C Circular 8"

Tap Factory Made Active, at 03 o'clock, 6",
within 8 inch: YES

01:28a

10.04.2011

85'02"

City of Costa Mesa
Maintenance Services Division
FIELD INSPECTION – TREE INFORMATION

ATTACHMENT #2

Denial <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Category 1 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	2 <input type="checkbox"/>	3 <input type="checkbox"/>
Supporting <input type="checkbox"/>	Category 1 <input type="checkbox"/>	2 <input type="checkbox"/>	3 <input type="checkbox"/>

Date Request Received: **May 21, 2013**

Name of Resident: **Thomas Lightvoet** Requesting Party: _____

Address: **2737 Cardinal Drive F1** Address: _____

Home Phone: **714-641-6817** Home Phone: _____

Work Phone: _____ Work Phone: _____

Date Inspected: **5/29/2013**

Inspected By: **Daniel Dominguez III – Interim City Arborist**

Parkway Maintenance Report:

Tree Species: **Pinus canariensis** Removal Cost: (DBH x \$20.00)= **\$ 380.00**

Height: **45 Feet** Width of Sidewalk: **4 Feet**

Trunk Diameter: **19 Inches** Size of Right-of-Way: **10 Feet**

Health: Good Fair Poor Date of Last Pruning: **7/12/2012**

Is the Tree a good candidate for Relocation? Yes No

Likelihood of survival: Good Fair Poor

Comments: **Will require a large root ball which will impact curb & gutter, asphalt street, sidewalk, and private walk ways. Estimated value stated in Arbor Access is \$4,890.00.**

Concrete Damage: Yes No

If Yes, describe damage: **1 1/2" lift of sidewalk south of the tree. Cracked and displaced curb & gutter.**

Can the Tree be Root Pruned: Yes No Date: _____

Root Pruning Comments: **NA. Root pruning will not resolve sewer issue.**

Date of Response to Resident: _____

Date Information Packet Mailed: _____

Photos Taken: Yes No Date Photos Taken: **6/05/2013**

Photo #1: **Street view looking west**

Photo #2: **Street view looking south**

Photo #3: **Street view looking north**

Photo #4: **Base of the tree**



<--Prev Next-->

Site on 5 lists

[Edit Tree Site](#) - [Insert History](#) - [Calls](#) - [Street View](#) - [Photo Album](#) - [Notes](#)

Select a list

[Create a list](#) - [Add site to list](#)

Site Detail (33.67049787182,-117.93597409711)

District	Address	Location	Species	DBH	Height
16	2737 CARDINAL DR	Front-1	<i>Pinus canariensis</i> CANARY ISLAND PINE	13-18	45-60
Condition	Maintenance	Removal Priority	Estimated Value	Parkway Type	Parkway Size
Good	Grid Trim	N/A	\$4,890	Parkway	5
Utility	Valid				
No	Yes				

Work History

Crew	Work Date	Work Type	Job #/Acct #	Amount
WCA	7/12/2012	Grid Pruning	22374	\$46.60
WCA	4/9/2009	Grid Pruning	12656	\$46.60
WCA	1/10/2007	Grid Pruning	9754	\$41.50
WCA	2/24/2004	Grid Trimming	6173	\$41.50
WCA	5/9/2001	Grid Trimming	3569	\$40.10

:: Costa Maintenance ::
View

Monday, July 8, 2013

[| Home](#) | [| Submit a Request](#) | [| List Open Records](#) | [| List All Records](#) | [| Search](#)

[Change Password](#) | [Reports](#) |

Subject: Request for tree removal & replacement based on sewer issues.

Detailed description:

Request for removal & replacement of pine tree based on sewer issues. Resident was notified by CMSD regarding roots at connection from lateral to main line.

Req'd date:	2011-10-17	Req'd by:	Tom Lightvoet
Location:	2737 Cardinal Drive	Phone:	714-641-6817
Work Order Nr:	11101599	District:	16
Supervisor:	City Arborist	Employee:	Dominguez, Dan
Call back needed:	Y	Contacted date:	2011-11-17
OSHA safety concern:	N	Status:	Closed
Completion date:	2011-11-17	Inspection date:	2011-11-17
Hours:	0 Minutes: 10	Material cost:	0.00

Action taken:

Canary Island Pine. Tree in good condition. Large Podocarpus growing in front yard may be contributing to root intrusion. Does not meet removal criteria Cat1 or 2. Resident will have to provide documentation and video for review of the line. Left message regarding policy and the need for documentation and a video to review before we can go any further with request. DanD

Password: 

.: Costa Maintenance :.
View

Monday, July 8, 2013

Change Password |
Reports |

| [Home](#) | | [Submit a Request](#) | [List Open Records](#) | [List All Records](#) | [Search](#)

Subject: Tree removal request based on sewer issues.

Detailed description:

Resident personally provided a letter requesting removal of the tree based on sewer issues and provided a sewer video. Reference previous work order 10/17/11.

Req'd date:	2013-05-24 (Request entered by: MStueve)	Req'd by:	Tom Lightvoet
Location:	2737 Cardinal Drive	Phone:	714- 641- 6817
Work Order Nr:	13050874	District:	16
Supervisor:	City Arborist	Employee:	Dominguez, Dan
Call back needed:	Y	Contacted date:	2013-05-29
OSHA safety concern:	N	Status:	Closed
Completion date:	2013-06-05	Inspection date:	2013-05-29
Hours:	0 Minutes: 45	Material cost:	0.00

Action taken:

5/29/13 Reviewed DVDs provided by resident. The video showing root intrusion did not have a footage marker on the camera. Footage was from inside the house. The second video was from the newly installed cleanout. The lateral line is greater than 15' from City tree. Spoke to resident and we will review the videos together next Tuesday. Call and set up time on Tuesday morning. PENDING DD 6/4/13 Reviewed video with resident. No change in the status of the tree. Tree will have to go to Commission for removal request. Field inspection report created. DD

Password: 

Costa Maintenance - © 2006 - 2013 - City of Costa Mesa







