



# **PARKS AND RECREATION COMMISSION AGENDA REPORT**

---

MEETING DATE: OCTOBER 24, 2013

ITEM NUMBER: 10a

**SUBJECT:** TREE REMOVAL REQUEST - 2116 PRESIDENT PLACE

**DATE:** OCTOBER 7, 2013

**FROM:** PUBLIC SERVICES DEPARTMENT, MAINTENANCE SERVICES DIVISION

**PRESENTATION BY:** BRUCE A. HARTLEY, MAINTENANCE SERVICES MANAGER

**FOR FURTHER INFORMATION CONTACT:** BRUCE A. HARTLEY (714) 754-5123

---

## **RECOMMENDATION**

Approve the request for the removal of one City-owned parkway tree located in the public right-of-way at 2116 President Place with the condition that the Applicant pay all removal and replacement costs.

## **BACKGROUND**

The Maintenance Services Division was initially contacted by the Applicant on June 25, 2013, requesting removal and replacement of the parkway tree, claiming the roots of the tree were damaging their driveway. The Applicant was cited by the City's Code Enforcement Division for the poor condition of the driveway.

## **ANALYSIS**

The City Arborist inspected the tree, an Evergreen or Shamel Ash, *Fraxinus uhdei*, on June 25, 2013, and found it to be healthy and in good condition. The tree is approximately sixty-five feet (65') in height with a trunk diameter of forty inches (40"). The tree is growing in an open area with no irrigation. The public right-of-way width at this location is eight feet (8'). The estimated value of the tree is \$17,220.

The driveway is located ten and one half feet (10.5') away from the base of the tree. It appeared to the Arborist that the driveway has likely been damaged partially from tree roots, with additional damage likely due to soil expansion or construction related causes, not attributable to the City tree. The tree could be root pruned and barriers installed to protect the current or replacement driveway from damage. The tree does not need to be removed for the Applicant to remedy the City's Code Enforcement citation.

The Arborist could not find any health and safety concerns with the tree that would meet the criteria established in the Streetscape and Median Development Standards for a Category 1 – Health and Safety removal. The tree however, is a 'problem tree species' per the Standards and meets the criteria for a Category 2 removal; which allows for the removal of the tree at the expense of the Applicant. The cost to the Applicant would be \$800 to remove the tree. The Arborist met with the Applicant on June 27, 2013 and explained the three categories regulating tree removal in the City. Although the tree

qualifies for a Category 2 – Accelerated Removal, the cost would be borne by the Applicant. The Applicant is requesting the removal be performed by the City's expense

The City received a letter from the Applicant on September 6, 2013, requesting the City remove the tree. See Attachment 1. The Applicant's letter provided the following reasons for the removal request:

- Overgrown roots are affecting the structure of the property and causing major damage to the concrete slab of the driveway.
- The tree is a safety concern because the roots uplifted the driveway and may continue to do further damages.

The City Arborist evaluated the tree for possible relocation, but believes that due to the size and cost of relocating the tree, relocation is not recommended.

The Applicant has been notified of the Parks and Recreation Commission meeting and has been sent a copy of this staff report.

### **ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED**

1. The Commission could authorize the removal and replacement of the tree, per the Streetscape and Median Development Standards, Section 4.0.3 – Discretionary Removals, which would require the replacement of the tree with one (1) twenty-four inch box-size tree to be planted at the same address and two (2) fifteen gallon-size trees to be planted elsewhere on City property. The applicant would pay all removal and replacement costs.

If approved by the Commission, the tree must be removed and mitigation trees provided to the City within one year from the date of final approval, after which the approval expires.

2. The Commission could authorize the removal of the tree as a Category 1 – 'Health and Safety' removal with all removal and replacement costs paid for by the City.
3. The Commission could deny the removal of the tree and direct staff to prune the roots of the tree and install root barriers to prevent further damage to private property improvements.

### **FISCAL REVIEW**

There would be no fiscal impact to the City if the request to remove the tree was denied; approved as a Category 2 – Accelerated Removal; or approved as a Category 3 - Discretionary Removal, as the applicant would pay all costs.

The replanting costs for the mitigation trees (1 – 24" box size and 2 – 15 gallon size) would be \$425. Costs are based on current City contract prices. Total cost to the Applicant for removal and replacement would be \$1,225.

If the Commission were to approve the request to remove the tree as a Category 1 - Health and Safety Removal, with the City paying removal and replacement costs, the cost for the removal of the tree would be \$800, with a cost of replanting 1 – 24" box size tree of \$200.

## LEGAL REVIEW

No legal review is required for this item.

## CONCLUSION

The City-owned street tree that is being requested to be removed is located within the public right-of-way at 2116 President Place. The tree is in good condition. The Applicant initially requested removal of the tree due to problems associated with the roots in the driveway, but added additional concerns regarding safety.

The City Arborist determined that the tree is in good condition, but is listed as a 'problem tree species' and therefore meets the criteria for a Category 2 removal. However, the Applicant is requesting the City remove the tree at the City's expense. It is recommended that the Commission approve the request as a Category 2 - Accelerated Removal, with the condition that the Applicant pay for the removal and replacement of the tree.

  
BRUCE A. HARTLEY  
Maintenance Services Manager

  
ERNESTO MUNOZ  
Public Services Director

ATTACHMENTS: 1. Letter from Applicant  
2. Tree Information  
3. Photographs

C: Marilia Rosa  
2116 President Place  
Costa Mesa, CA 92627

Marilia C. Rosa  
2116 President Place  
Costa Mesa, CA 92627



September 3, 2013

City of Costa Mesa  
Bruce Hartley  
Public Services - Maintenance Services  
P.O. Box 1200 - Costa Mesa, CA 92628

**RE: Request to Remove City-Owned Tree in front of  
2116 President Place**

We are respectfully requesting the City to remove the tree which is located in front of my home. The attached pictures provided by officer Barbara J. Zwart, shows that the overgrown roots are affecting the structure of the property and causing major damages to the concrete slab of our driveway.

This tree also continues to be a safety concern for our family and the neighborhood kids which can cause personal damage and **even personal injury** because of the tree roots uplifted my driveway and may continue to do further damages.

In regards to the appearance of our front yard, the family that was renting our home neglected to water and maintained the lawn. They also did not pay their rent for the last 18 months which caused a great financial burden to us. After recently evicting the renters, rest assured that we are committed to keeping our home clean again and making it a safe environment. We owned and live at this property for the over 20years and we take pride of ownership.

We are again requesting your assistance in **removing the tree and the cost of repairs of our driveway.** Please advise if there's a claim form that we need to fill out in order to get our request processed right away.

---

Your prompt response is greatly appreciated and we thank you in advance.

Sincerely



Mrs. Marilla C. Rosa

~~XXXXXXXXXX~~

2013.08.16 14:49:25



2013.08.16 14:48:36



2013.08.16 14:48:57

2116 President Pl

City of Costa Mesa  
Maintenance Services Division  
**FIELD INSPECTION – TREE INFORMATION**

**ATTACHMENT #2**

Denial	<input type="checkbox"/>	Category	1 <input type="checkbox"/>	2 <input type="checkbox"/>	3 <input type="checkbox"/>
Supporting	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Category	1 <input type="checkbox"/>	2 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	3 <input type="checkbox"/>

Date Request Received: 9/06/2013

Name of Resident: Marilia C. Rosa Requesting Party: \_\_\_\_\_

Address: 2116 President Pl. Address: \_\_\_\_\_

Home Phone: [REDACTED] Home Phone: \_\_\_\_\_

Work Phone: \_\_\_\_\_ Work Phone: \_\_\_\_\_

Date Inspected: 9/24/2013

Inspected By: Daniel Dominguez III – Interim City Arborist

Parkway Maintenance Report:

Tree Species: Fraxinus uhdei Removal Cost: (DBH x \$20.00)= **\$800.00**

Height: 65 Feet Width of Sidewalk: NA

Trunk Diameter: 40 inches Size of Right-of-Way: 8 Feet

Health: Good  Fair  Poor  Date of Last Pruning: 5/31/2013

Is the Tree a good candidate for Relocation? Yes  No

Likelihood of survival: Good  Fair  Poor

Comments: **Tree is too large to move. Estimated value in Arbor Access is \$17,220.00**

Concrete Damage: Yes  No

If Yes, describe damage: **Curb & gutter recently replaced. Driveway located 10' to the north of the tree. A portion of the driveway damage is from tree roots.**

Can the Tree be Root Pruned: Yes  No  Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Root Pruning Comments: **If the driveway is to be replaced, roots can be trimmed within the ROW at that time.**

Date of Response to Resident: \_\_\_\_\_

Date Information Packet Mailed: \_\_\_\_\_

Photos Taken: Yes  No  Date Photos Taken: 9/24/2013

Photo #1: **Street view looking east**

Photo #2: **Street view looking north**

Photo #3: **Street view looking south**

Photo #4: **Base of tree and driveway damage**









