



PARKS AND RECREATION COMMISSION AGENDA REPORT

MEETING DATE: OCTOBER 24, 2013

ITEM NUMBER: 10b

SUBJECT: TREE REMOVAL REQUEST - 2197 SANTA ANA AVENUE

DATE: OCTOBER 7, 2013

FROM: PUBLIC SERVICES DEPARTMENT, MAINTENANCE SERVICES DIVISION

PRESENTATION BY: BRUCE A. HARTLEY, MAINTENANCE SERVICES MANAGER

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION CONTACT: BRUCE A. HARTLEY (714) 754-5123

RECOMMENDATION

Approve the request for the removal of three City-owned parkway trees located in the public right-of-way on the side property of 2197 Santa Ana Avenue.

BACKGROUND

The Maintenance Services Division was initially contacted by the Applicant on May 21, 2013, requesting removal and replacement of the parkway trees, located on the 22nd Street side of her property, because they are dead.

ANALYSIS

The City Arborist inspected the trees, Aleppo Pines, *Pinus halepensis*, on May 22, 2013 and found them to be in fair condition. All three trees measure approximately thirty-five feet (35') in height with a trunk diameter of fourteen inches (14"). The public right-of-way width at this location is ten feet (10'). The trees have been maintained by the resident for some time. They have never been maintained by the City and no records exist for maintenance. The trees are infested with western gall rust and some branch dieback is occurring throughout the canopy. Additionally, the trees are planted a few feet from the roof line, are growing close to the foundation of the home and are under overhead power lines. Southern California Edison (SCE) has maintained line clearance through regular topping of the trees. See Attachment 2.

The three trees do not meet the criteria for removal as stated in the Streetscape and Median Development Standards. However, there are several concerns with the trees. They are obviously under stress from repeatedly being topped, resulting in insect and disease pressure. The trees are growing very close to the roof line of the adjacent home and within just a few feet of the building's foundation.

Up to this point, the trees were not considered City owned parkway trees. With verification of the public right-of-way, the trees are now confirmed to be on public property and there may be future liability associated with any damage the trees may cause, regardless of who planted them. The resident has provided maintenance, arboricultural evaluations and pest control for these trees in the past.

The City received a letter from the Applicant on September 4, 2013, requesting the City removal and replace the trees. See Attachment 1. The Applicant's letter provided the following reasons for the removal request:

- The trees are dead.
- Due to age, she is no longer able to climb the roof to clean the pine needles out of the gutters and off the roof.
- Concerned that the trees may fall during a big wind.

The City Arborist evaluated the trees for possible relocation, but believes that due to the size and cost of relocating the trees, relocation is not recommended.

The Applicant has been notified of the Parks and Recreation Commission meeting and has been sent a copy of this staff report.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED

1. The Commission could authorize the removal and replacement of the trees, per the Streetscape and Median Development Standards, Section 4.0.3 – Discretionary Removals, which would require the replacement of the trees with one (1) twenty-four inch box-size tree and two (2) fifteen gallon-size trees to be planted elsewhere on City property. The City would replant only two of the 24" box-size trees at that location. The applicant would pay all removal and replacement costs.

If approved by the Commission, the trees must be removed and mitigation trees provided to the City or an in lieu fee paid within one year from the date of final approval, after which the approval expires.

2. The Commission could authorize the removal of the trees as a Category 1 – 'Health and Safety' removal with all removal and replacement costs paid for by the City. The City would plant two (2) 24 inch box-size trees at that location.
3. The Commission could deny the request.

FISCAL REVIEW

There would be no fiscal impact to the City if the request to remove the tree was either denied or approved as a Category 3 - Discretionary Removal, as the applicant would pay all costs.

For the Commission's information, the cost for the removal of the three trees would be \$840. The replanting costs for the mitigation trees (1 – 24" box size and 2 – 15 gallon size) would be \$1,275. Costs are based on current City contract prices. Total cost for removal and replacement would be \$2,115. The value of each of the trees is estimated to be \$1,380.

LEGAL REVIEW

No legal review is required for this item.

CONCLUSION

The City-owned street trees that are being requested to be removed and replaced are located within the public right-of-way on the side property on 22nd Street. The trees are in fair condition. The Applicant is requesting removal and replacement of the trees because they are diseased and due to her age, she can no longer maintain the pine needles.

It is recommended that the Commission approve the request to remove the trees with the Applicant paying all the costs associated with their removal and replacement.


BRUCE A. HARTLEY
Maintenance Services Manager


ERNESTO MUNOZ
Public Services Director

ATTACHMENTS: 1. Letter from Applicant
2. Tree Information
3. Photographs

C: Penelope Venola
2197 Santa Ana Avenue
Costa Mesa, CA 92627

Bruce Hartley, Maintenance Services Manager
City of Costa Mesa
Public Services, Maintenance Services Division
PO Box 1200
Costa Mesa, CA 92627-1200

ATTACHMENT #1

3 September 2013



Dear Mr. Hartley,

I have been maintaining my trees along 22nd Street for 30 years. I recently asked the city to inspect them because they are dying despite many injections for bark beetles and regular trimming. Yes, the inspector said they were dying and they are on city right-of-way.

I have three black pines and two mock orange trees. The estimates for injecting the pines which have some form of bark beetle start at \$1200 and the three arborists who came out all said it was throwing money away, the trees are dying. The mock orange trees have just plain worn out—my house is an original Costa Mesa farmhouse that is 90 years old. The estimates for removing the trees have gone from \$1200-\$2400

Dead is dead so there are no alternatives to removal or transplanting. I would love to replace the pines with something tall and columnar. Would sycamore count? Anything to help make the house look like it snuggles into the corner. The two mock orange trees could be replaced with white crepe myrtle.

Both of these alternatives would fit in with my landscaping unless there is something more appropriate.

This would not detract from the aesthetics of the neighborhood or the existing planting theme as this is the corner of 22nd Street and Santa Ana Avenue. The goal of the planting is to help detract from the noise and lighting blight of car headlights and industrial street lighting as well as improve the aesthetics of the house. The only neighbors adjacent are across 22nd Street.

At 70 years of age, I can no longer climb up on the roof to clean pine needles out of the gutters and off the roof. The idea of dead trees falling during a big wind does not thrill me, nor does paying to have them removed sound good on a fixed income. I would appreciate hearing from you about getting this problem solved.

Most sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Penelope Venola". The signature is written in black ink and is positioned above the typed name.

Penelope Venola

██████████
2197 Santa Ana Avenue
Costa Mesa, CA 92627

City of Costa Mesa
Maintenance Services Division
FIELD INSPECTION – TREE INFORMATION

ATTACHMENT #2

Denial	<input type="checkbox"/>	Category	1 <input type="checkbox"/>	2 <input type="checkbox"/>	3 <input type="checkbox"/>
Supporting	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Category	1 <input type="checkbox"/>	2 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	3 <input type="checkbox"/>

Date Request Received: 9/4/2013

Name of Resident: Penelope Venola Requesting Party: _____

Address: 2197 Santa Ana Ave. S4 Address: _____

Home Phone: _____ Home Phone: _____

Work Phone: _____ Work Phone: _____

Date Inspected: 9/6/2013

Inspected By: Daniel Dominguez III – Interim City Arborist

Parkway Maintenance Report:

Tree Species: Pinus halepensis S4 Removal Cost: (DBH x \$20.00)= \$280 .00

Height: 35 Feet Width of Sidewalk: 4.5 Feet

Trunk Diameter: 14 inches Size of Right-of-Way: 10 Feet

Health: Good Fair Poor Date of Last Pruning: **No record of City trimming**

Is the Tree a good candidate for Relocation? Yes No

Likelihood of survival: Good Fair Poor

Comments: **Tree growing under overhead power line, SCE crews have topped the trees. Tree infested with western gall rust. Estimated value in Arbor Acss is \$1,380.00**

Concrete Damage: Yes No

If Yes, describe damage:

Can the Tree be Root Pruned: Yes No Date: _____

Root Pruning Comments: **Root pruning not required, no hardscape damage. Trees growing in a raised planter bed.**

Date of Response to Resident: _____

Date Information Packet Mailed: _____

Photos Taken: Yes No Date Photos Taken: 9/6/2013

Photo #1: Street view looking south

Photo #2: Street view looking east

Photo #3: Base of tree

Photo #4: Western Gall Rust

**City of Costa Mesa
Maintenance Services Division
FIELD INSPECTION – TREE INFORMATION**

Denial <input type="checkbox"/>	Category	1 <input type="checkbox"/>	2 <input type="checkbox"/>	3 <input type="checkbox"/>
Supporting <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Category	1 <input type="checkbox"/>	2 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	3 <input type="checkbox"/>

Date Request Received: 9/4/2013

Name of Resident: Penelope Venola Requesting Party: _____

Address: 2197 Santa Ana Ave. S5 Address: _____

Home Phone: _____ Home Phone: _____

Work Phone: _____ Work Phone: _____

Date Inspected: 9/6/2013

Inspected By: Daniel Dominguez III – Interim City Arborist

Parkway Maintenance Report:

Tree Species: Pinus halepensis S5 Removal Cost: (DBH x \$20.00)= \$280 .00

Height: 35 Feet Width of Sidewalk: 4.5 Feet

Trunk Diameter: 14 inches Size of Right-of-Way: 10 Feet

Health: Good Fair Poor Date of Last Pruning: **No record of City trimming**

Is the Tree a good candidate for Relocation? Yes No

Likelihood of survival: Good Fair Poor

Comments: **Tree growing under overhead power line, SCE crews have topped the trees. Tree infested with western gall rust. Estimated value in Arbor Acss is \$1,380.00**

Concrete Damage: Yes No

If Yes, describe damage:

Can the Tree be Root Pruned: Yes No Date: _____

Root Pruning Comments: **Root pruning not required, no hardscape damage. Trees growing in a raised planter bed.**

Date of Response to Resident: _____

Date Information Packet Mailed: _____

Photos Taken: Yes No Date Photos Taken: 9/6/2013

Photo #1: Street view looking south

Photo #2: Street view looking east

Photo #3: Base of tree

Photo #4: Western Gall Rust

**City of Costa Mesa
Maintenance Services Division
FIELD INSPECTION – TREE INFORMATION**

Denial <input type="checkbox"/>	Category	1 <input type="checkbox"/>	2 <input type="checkbox"/>	3 <input type="checkbox"/>
Supporting <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Category	1 <input type="checkbox"/>	2 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	3 <input type="checkbox"/>

Date Request Received: 9/4/2013

Name of Resident: Penelope Venola Requesting Party: _____

Address: 2197 Santa Ana Ave. S6 Address: _____

Home Phone: _____ Home Phone: _____

Work Phone: _____ Work Phone: _____

Date Inspected: 9/6/2013

Inspected By: Daniel Dominguez III – Interim City Arborist

Parkway Maintenance Report:

Tree Species: Pinus halepensis S6 Removal Cost: (DBH x \$20.00)= **\$280 .00**

Height: 35 Feet Width of Sidewalk: 4.5 Feet

Trunk Diameter: 14 inches Size of Right-of-Way: 10 Feet

Health: Good Fair Poor Date of Last Pruning: **No record of City trimming**

Is the Tree a good candidate for Relocation? Yes No

Likelihood of survival: Good Fair Poor

Comments: **Tree growing under overhead power line, SCE crews have topped the trees. Tree infested with western gall rust. Estimated value in Arbor Acss is \$1,380.00**

Concrete Damage: Yes No

If Yes, describe damage:

Can the Tree be Root Pruned: Yes No Date: _____

Root Pruning Comments: **Root pruning not required, no hardscape damage. Trees growing in a raised planter bed.**

Date of Response to Resident: _____

Date Information Packet Mailed: _____

Photos Taken: Yes No Date Photos Taken: 9/6/2013

Photo #1: Street view looking south

Photo #2: Street view looking east

Photo #3: Base of tree

Photo #4: Western Gall Rust





BASE OF S5 TREE



SYMPTOMS OF WESTERN GALL RUST

