



PARKS AND RECREATION COMMISSION AGENDA REPORT

MEETING DATE: MAY 22, 2014

ITEM NUMBER:

SUBJECT: TREE REMOVAL REQUEST - 2721 CARDINAL DRIVE

DATE: MAY 5, 2014

FROM: PUBLIC SERVICES DEPARTMENT, MAINTENANCE SERVICES DIVISION

PRESENTATION BY: BRUCE A. HARTLEY, MAINTENANCE SERVICES MANAGER

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION CONTACT: BRUCE A. HARTLEY (714) 754-5123

RECOMMENDATION

Deny the request for the removal of one City-owned parkway tree located in the public right-of-way at 2721 Cardinal Drive.

BACKGROUND

The Maintenance Services Division was initially contacted by the Applicant in January 2014 reporting sewer issues due to the parkway tree. At that time, the Arborist inspected the tree and found it to be in good condition; no video inspection of the sewer lateral was provided and the request to remove the tree was denied. The City received a letter from the Applicant on April 8, 2014 requesting removal of the tree. On April 9, 2014 the Applicant again contacted the City regarding the tree and provided a DVD documenting the inspection of the sewer lateral.

ANALYSIS

The City Arborist inspected the tree, a Canary Island Pine, *Pinus canariensis*, on January 3, 2014, and found it to be healthy and in good condition. The tree is approximately thirty-five feet (35') in height with a trunk diameter of thirty-three inches (33"). The public right-of-way width at this location is ten feet (10') adjacent to a four foot (4') wide sidewalk. The Arborist observed that the sidewalk has been shaved; no trip hazard exists. The tree can be root pruned. However, root pruning will not mitigate root intrusion into the sewer lateral. The sewer lateral line is located fifteen feet (15') measured horizontally, south of the tree. The tree has been pruned on a typical three year trimming cycle; and was last pruned on July 12, 2012.

The recording of the lateral line inspection documented root intrusion into the sewer later at seventeen feet (17'), thirty-two feet (32') and thirty-six feet (36') from the point of entry. The intrusion of roots at seventeen feet from the cleanout would indicate that other plants may be impacting the integrity of the lateral in addition to the City tree, and that re-lining the lateral should be considered. The policy that the City currently uses to assign cause to the City owned tree requires the lateral to be within ten feet (10') of the tree to meet the requirement for a Category 1 – Health and Safety Removal. The lateral is greater than ten feet (10') from the tree.

The Canary Island Pine tree requested to be removed, does not meet criteria for a staff level authorization for removal as stated in the Streetscape and Median Development Standards. The Applicant was informed of that decision and was provided the removal criteria.

The City received a letter from the Applicant on April 8, 2014, requesting the City remove the tree. See Attachment 1. The Applicant's letter provided the following reasons for the removal request:

- The maintenance of the sewer line has increased and they can no longer afford to maintain the issue.
- The roots are causing sidewalk damage and intruding into the street.
- Other neighbors with smaller trees and less issues were able to have the City remove the parkway trees.

The City Arborist evaluated the tree for possible relocation, but believes that due to the size and cost of relocating the tree, relocation is not recommended.

The Applicant has been notified of the Parks and Recreation Commission meeting and has been sent a copy of this staff report.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED

1. The Commission could authorize the removal and replacement of the tree, per the Streetscape and Median Development Standards, Section 4.0.3 – Discretionary Removals, which would require the replacement of the tree with one (1) twenty-four inch box-size tree to be planted at the same address and two (2) fifteen gallon-size trees to be planted elsewhere on City property. The applicant would pay all removal and replacement costs.

If approved by the Commission, the tree must be removed and mitigation trees provided to the City within one year from the date of final approval, after which the approval expires.

2. The Commission could authorize the removal of the tree as a Category 1 – 'Health and Safety' removal with all removal and replacement costs paid for by the City.

FISCAL REVIEW

There would be no fiscal impact to the City if the request to remove the tree was either denied or approved as a Category 3; Discretionary Removal, as the applicant would pay all costs.

For the Commission's information, the cost for the removal of the tree would be \$660. The replanting costs for the mitigation trees (1 – 24" box size and 2 – 15 gallon size) would be \$425. Costs are based on current City contract prices. Total cost for removal and replacement would be \$1,085. The value of the tree is estimated to be \$14,740.

LEGAL REVIEW

No legal review is required for this item.

CONCLUSION

The City-owned street tree that has been requested to be removed is located within the public right-of-way at 2721 Cardinal Drive. The tree is in good condition. The Applicant is experiencing sewer issues caused by root intrusion and is requesting removal of the parkway tree. There is root intrusion into the lateral line in three locations between the house and the street. The lateral is not within the ten foot radius of the parkway tree that is typically required to meet the City's criteria for a Category 1 removal and there may be other plants growing the yard that may be contributing to the problem, therefore staff recommends that the Commission deny the request.


BRUCE A. HARTLEY
Maintenance Services Manager


for ERNESTO MUNOZ
Public Services Director

ATTACHMENTS: 1. Letter from Applicant
2. Tree Information
3. Photographs

C: Jeanne Miller
2721 Cardinal Drive
Costa Mesa, CA 92626



City of Costa Mesa

Public Services, Maintenance Services Division

Attention: Bruce Hartley, Maintenance Services Manager

P.O. Box 1200

Costa Mesa, Ca 92628-1200

This request is for tree removal from residential property owners, Jeanne and Chris Miller at 2721 Cardinal Drive, Costa Mesa, CA 92626. (Owners for 13 years) We have paid for camera of roots and will supplement this letter with live camera via internet and bills for especially the last two years which have increased of pipe maintenance rooting out plumbing due to the city tree placed on the street side of the sidewalk easement. Honestly, it has cost us \$1,200 in applying cleanout plus at least two plumbers a year since we moved in in 2000. But we will focus on the last two or three years which plumbers calls have increased to 4 times a year. I have photos of sidewalk damage due to the tree and proof that the roots are intruding into the street as well.

The girth of this pine tree is the largest on the entire street and we found out that other neighbors with smaller trees with less issues were able to have the city remove the parkway trees. We can no longer afford to maintain this issue. Please feel free to give us a list of what you need to remove this tree, but we are certain that we fulfill the criteria. My contact number is ~~949-448-1234~~

*I hope we
can set up a meeting
as soon as possible.*

Thank you in advance,

Sincerely,

Jeanne Miller
Jeanne Miller

City of Costa Mesa
Maintenance Services Division
FIELD INSPECTION – TREE INFORMATION

ATTACHMENT #2

Date Request Received: 4/8/2014
Name of Resident: Jeanne Miller Requesting Party: _____
Address: 2721 Cardinal Drive Address: _____
Home Phone: _____ Home Phone: _____
Work Phone: _____ Work Phone: _____

Date Inspected: 5/5/2014
Inspected By: Daniel Dominguez III – Interim City Arborist
Parkway Maintenance Report:

Tree Species: Pinus canariensis F1 Removal Cost: (DBH x \$20.00)= \$ 660.00
Height: 35 Feet Width of Sidewalk: 4 Feet
Trunk Diameter: 33 Inches Size of Right-of-Way: 10 Feet

Health: Good Fair Poor Date of Last Pruning: 7/12/2012

Is the Tree a good candidate for Relocation? Yes No

Likelihood of survival: Good Fair Poor

Tree size and location will require removal and replacement of sidewalk, curb & gutter, and asphalt street. Estimated tree value \$14,740.00

Concrete Damage: Yes No

If Yes, describe damage: **Cracked and lifted sidewalk. Sidewalk has been shaved, no trip hazard exists.**

Can the Tree be Root Pruned: Yes No Date: _____

Root Pruning Comments: **Root pruning will not mitigate root intrusion into the sewer lateral. Sewer lateral run is 15' south of the tree.**

Date of Response to Resident: _____

Date Information Packet Mailed: _____

Photos Taken: Yes No Date Photos Taken: 4/05/2014

Photo #1: Street view looking west

Photo #2: Street view looking south

Photo #3: Street view looking north

Photo #4: Base of the tree





