



PARKS AND RECREATION COMMISSION AGENDA REPORT

MEETING DATE: JUNE 26, 2014

ITEM NUMBER:

SUBJECT: TREE REMOVAL REQUEST - 3124 COOLIDGE AVENUE

DATE: JUNE 12, 2014

FROM: PUBLIC SERVICES DEPARTMENT, MAINTENANCE SERVICES DIVISION

PRESENTATION BY: BRUCE A. HARTLEY, MAINTENANCE SERVICES MANAGER

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION CONTACT: BRUCE A. HARTLEY (714) 754-5123

RECOMMENDATION

Deny the request for the removal of one City-owned parkway tree located in the public right-of-way at 3124 Coolidge Avenue.

BACKGROUND

The Maintenance Services Division was initially contacted by the Applicant on March 26, 2014, reporting damage to the sidewalk due to the parkway tree.

ANALYSIS

The City Arborist inspected the tree, a Southern Magnolia, *Magnolia grandiflora*, on May 2, 2014, and found it to be healthy and in good condition. The tree is approximately thirty feet (30') in height with a trunk diameter of eighteen inches (18"). The tree is growing in a small space between two driveways. This type of location is typically considered an invalid planting address and is no longer planted with parkway trees due to the lack of available growing space. At this location, it has been observed that ramping and grinding of the sidewalk has been done in the past to address raised concrete; the curb and gutter has also been replaced in the past. On December 13, 2012 two asphalt ramps were installed; both were two inches (2") in height.

The Magnolia tree, a species that typically has extensive spreading root systems, is completely surrounded by concrete, with no turf or other irrigated landscape surrounding it. The presence of a ground cover of ¾" rock, indicates that this area likely receives no supplemental water and may be utilized as a path of travel for the property owners' pickup truck, which parks on concrete that has been added adjacent to the driveway. This use likely has resulted in serious compaction and little opportunity for tree roots to obtain the necessary moisture and nutrients needed. Roots have spread laterally and are shallow, due to a lack of water.

The Arborist could not find any health and safety concerns with the tree that would meet the criteria for a Category 1 removal. The tree is not a 'problem tree species' and therefore did not meet the criteria for a Category 2 removal. The tree has been pruned on a typical three year trimming cycle, and was last pruned on April 26, 2011.

The Magnolia tree requested to be removed, does not meet criteria for a staff level authorization for removal as stated in the Streetscape and Median Development Standards. The Applicant was informed of that decision and was provided the removal criteria.

The City received a letter from the Applicant dated April 16, 2014, requesting the City remove the Magnolia tree. See Attachment 1. The Applicant's letter provided the following reasons for the removal request:

- The tree is overgrown and causing damage to the sidewalk, driveways and driveway aprons between 3124 and 3128 Coolidge.
- The aprons were replaced along with curb, gutters and a section of the street approximately ten years ago.
- Repairing the sidewalk without removing the tree will prolong the problem and reoccur again necessitating repair.

Additional correspondence was received from the Applicant on May 22, 2014, stating that they recently participated in a neighborhood garage sale and several people were tripping on the sidewalk and driveway; and that the driveway now has been affected by the tree roots and has lifted to the point that it's very dangerous. See Attachment 2.

The City Arborist evaluated the tree for possible relocation, but believes that due to the size and cost of relocating the tree, relocation is not recommended. The tree has been previously root pruned; additional root pruning may compromise the stability of the tree.

The Applicant has been notified of the Parks and Recreation Commission meeting and has been sent a copy of this staff report.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED

1. The Commission could authorize the removal and replacement of the tree, per the Streetscape and Median Development Standards, Section 4.0.3 – Discretionary Removals, which would require the replacement of the tree with one (1) twenty-four inch box-size tree and two (2) fifteen gallon-size trees to be planted elsewhere on City property. The applicant would pay all removal and replacement costs.

If approved by the Commission, the tree must be removed and mitigation trees provided to the City within one year from the date of final approval, after which the approval expires.

2. The Commission could authorize the removal of the tree as a Category 1 – 'Health and Safety' removal with all removal and replacement costs paid for by the City.

FISCAL REVIEW

There would be no fiscal impact to the City if the request to remove the tree was either denied or approved as a Category 3; Discretionary Removal, as the applicant would pay all costs.

For the Commission's information, the cost for the removal of the tree would be \$360. The replanting costs for the mitigation trees (1 – 24" box size and 2 – 15 gallon size)

would be \$425. Costs are based on current City contract prices. Total cost for removal and replacement would be \$785. The value of the tree is estimated to be \$4,890.

LEGAL REVIEW

No legal review is required for this item.

CONCLUSION

The City-owned street tree that has been requested to be removed is located within the public right-of-way at 3124 Coolidge Avenue. The tree is in good condition. The Applicant is requesting removal of the tree due to the roots causing damage to the sidewalk, curb and gutter.

The tree does not meet criteria required to allow for staff approval. The City Arborist determined that the tree is in good condition, and therefore, it is recommended that the Commission deny the request.



BRUCE A. HARTLEY
Maintenance Services Manager



ERNESTO MUNOZ
Public Services Director

ATTACHMENTS: 1. Letter from Applicant
2. Additional correspondence from Applicant
3. Tree Information
4. Photographs

C: Tony and Karen Angotti
3124 Coolidge Avenue
Costa Mesa, CA 92626

Resident
3128 Coolidge Avenue
Costa Mesa, CA 92626

April 16 2014

PUBLIC SERVICES

City of Costa Mesa

Public Services Director

This letter is in regards to sidewalk damage caused by an overgrown Magnolia tree on Coolidge Ave. The damaged area is between 3124 Coolidge and 3128 Coolidge Ave. The damage is beginning to extend to the driveways of our house at 3124 and the house next door at 3128 as well as the driveway aprons at the same addresses. (these aprons were replaced along with curbs, gutters and a section of the street approximately 10 years ago))

Over the years, the sidewalk has been ground down where it raised several times. The last time it was patched with asphalt.

We have spoken to Christina in the City Engineers office and were told the sidewalk is scheduled to be repaired. We said that if something wasn't done about the tree, the problem would reoccur.

Daniel Dominguez(City Arborist) checked the tree and said "It's getting close to time to do something about the tree, but that the tree was still healthy in spite of having roots cut 10 years ago.

This tree has grown too large for the area. It has damaged the sidewalk, the curb, the gutter, the street, the driveway aprons and is now starting to re-damage the repairs of 10 years ago and starting to lift our private driveways

The sidewalk is a safety hazard. Repairing the sidewalk without removing the tree will only prolong the problem. It will reoccur and have to be repaired again at additional expense.

Referring to 4.0 Criteria for parkway tree Removal/replacement.

4.0.1 Category 1 Health and safety removals.

The tree is causing a safety hazard causing significant sidewalk uplifting, and cracking. - a potential trip hazard.

Respectfully;



Tony and Karen Angotti

3124 Coolidge Ave

Costa Mesa, Ca. 92626

RECEIVED
MAY 22 2014

Tony & Karen Angotti
3124 Coolidge Ave
Costa Mesa, CA 92626

Bruce A. Hartley'
Maintenance Services Manager of City of Costa Mesa

Dear Mr. Hartley,

Thank you for the letter informing us of the meeting on June 26, 2014 where the tree in front of our home will be considered for removal. Just this past week-end there was a neighborhood Garage Sale and we participated.

Several people were tripping on the sidewalk and on our drive way due to the damage that the tree in front of our home has caused.

Our driveway now has been affected by the tree roots and has lifted to the point that it is very dangerous.

Here are some pictures showing the raised driveway and sidewalk.





Sincerely,

Karen Angotti
Tony Angotti

Tony & Karen Angotti

When the last repair was done about 10 years ago there was no damage to our driveway. This tree continues to cause damage to our personal property and sidewalk in front. People are starting to go across the street due to the damage in front of our home.

City of Costa Mesa
Maintenance Services Division
FIELD INSPECTION – TREE INFORMATION

ATTACHMENT #3

Date Request Received: **4-17-2014**
Name of Resident: **Tony & Karen Angotti** Requesting Party: _____
Address: **3124 Coolidge Ave.** Address: _____
Home Phone: _____ Home Phone: _____
Work Phone: _____ Work Phone: _____

Date Inspected: **5/02/14**
Inspected By: **Daniel Dominguez III Interim City Arborist**
Parkway Maintenance Report:

Tree Species: **Magnolia grandiflora F1** Removal Cost: (DBH x \$20.00)= \$ **360.00**
Height: **30 Feet** Width of Sidewalk: **4 Feet**
Trunk Diameter: **18 Inches** Size of Right-of-Way: **10 Feet**

Health: Good Fair Poor Date of Last Pruning: **4/26/2011**

Is the Tree a good candidate for Relocation? Yes No

Likelihood of survival: Good Fair Poor

Comments: **Magnolia trees do not respond well to extensive root pruning. Estimated tree value \$4,890.00.**

Concrete Damage: Yes No

If Yes, describe damage: **Sidewalk and drive approach lifted.**

Can the Tree be Root Pruned: Yes No Date: **3/20/03**

Root Pruning Comments: **Tree previously root pruned. Tree is growing in a small grow space, root pruning may compromise stability.**

Date of Response to Resident: _____

Date Information Packet Mailed: _____

Photos Taken: Yes No Date Photos Taken: **5/02/2014**

Photo #1: **Street view looking east**

Photo #2: **Street view looking north**

Photo #3: **Street view looking south**

Photo #4: **Base of tree**





