



# **PARKS AND RECREATION COMMISSION AGENDA REPORT**

---

MEETING DATE: OCTOBER 23, 2014

ITEM NUMBER:

SUBJECT: TREE REMOVAL REQUEST - 2059 FLAMINGO DRIVE

DATE: OCTOBER 13, 2014

FROM: PUBLIC SERVICES DEPARTMENT, MAINTENANCE SERVICES DIVISION

PRESENTATION BY: BRUCE A. HARTLEY, MAINTENANCE SERVICES MANAGER

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION CONTACT: BRUCE A. HARTLEY (714) 754-5123

---

## **RECOMMENDATION**

Deny the request for the removal of one (1) City-owned parkway tree located in the public right-of-way at 2059 Flamingo Drive.

## **BACKGROUND**

The Maintenance Services Division was initially contacted by the Applicant on September 11, 2014, stating that the tree roots from the City-owned parkway tree have filled the parkway strip, thus impeding the growth of any type of plant material. The Applicant requested removal of the tree based on several points highlighted in the analysis section of this report.

The Arborist evaluated the tree and surrounding site on September 19, 2014. A determination was made that the tree was eligible to be removed as a Section 4.0.2 – Accelerated Removal. It was communicated to the Applicant's son that this option is conditional upon fulfilling the obligations outlined in the criteria, including payment to the City for the tree removal cost and replacement trees. The Applicant followed up by contacting Maintenance Services on September 30, 2014 (via letter) requesting Section 4.0.3 – Discretionary Removal consideration be given based on the inconveniences associated with the tree roots, seed and seed pod litter that affects their ability to keep the sidewalk free of debris; difficulties encountered by a wheelchair-bound neighbor that traverses the sidewalk in front of their residence and the City's categorization of the parkway tree in question as a "problem species".

## **ANALYSIS**

The City Arborist initially inspected the tree on September 19, 2014. The tree is a Carrotwood, *Cupaniopsis anacardioides*. The tree was found to be healthy and in good condition. The tree is growing in a parkway that is five feet, three inches (5' 3") in width and is growing adjacent to a four foot (4') wide sidewalk. See Attachment 2.

The tree is growing in front of the property on Flamingo Drive. It is approximately twenty-five feet (25') in height with a trunk diameter of fourteen inches (14"). The tree is parkway centered and the spacing of infrastructure from the center of the tree trunk is consistent with the spacing requirements and standards used by many Southern California

municipalities. No mention of historic sewer line root intrusion was made by the Applicant.

The tree has been regularly pruned on a three year cycle, with the most recent pruning performed on May 1, 2012. Root pruning and the installation of a twelve inch deep root barrier was completed on November 26, 2003. It was observed that two sidewalk panels immediately adjacent to the tree were ground smooth to eliminate any potential hazard. Maintenance records indicate three (3) locations at this address were ground on September 4, 2013. See Attachment 2. There is currently no uplifted sidewalk hazard at this location.

The City Arborist evaluated the tree for possible relocation, but believes that due to the tree being a 'problem tree species' that relocation is not recommended.

The Carrotwood tree requested to be removed, does meet criteria for staff level authorization for removal, however, the cost of the removal as stated in the Streetscape and Median Development Standards must be incurred by the property owner. The Applicant was informed of this requirement and was provided the removal criteria.

The City received a letter from the Applicant dated September 30, 2014, requesting the Parks and Recreation Commission approve the removal of the City-owned parkway tree as a Category 4 – 0.3 Discretionary Removal. The Applicant's letter provided the following reasons for the removal request:

- The tree roots have occupied all of the soil in the parkway strip and that because of this, it is extremely difficult to grow any other plants in the parkway.
- The inconvenience/nuisance associated with tree roots that have spread into their front lawn requiring regular removal of "sucker" growth.
- Regardless of regular sweeping, the inconvenience/nuisance associated with the amount of seeds and pods the tree drops, consequently preventing the sidewalk from being free of debris.
- Concerns regarding a neighbor that uses a wheel chair twice daily to traverse the neighborhood and who is impeded in his path of travel due to seed pods that reportedly become embedded in his wheel chair tires.
- The City's categorization of Carrotwood as a "problem tree species" and the Applicant's belief that it is only a matter of time before the City-owned parkway tree will break the sidewalk and curb similar to how the sidewalk has already uplifted and has had to be shaved down to eliminate the hazard.

The Applicant been notified of the Parks and Recreation Commission meeting and has been sent a copy of this staff report.

## **ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED**

The Commission could authorize the removal and replacement of the tree, per the Streetscape and Median Development Standards, Section 4.0.3 – Discretionary Removals, which would require the replacement of the tree, with one (1) twenty-four inch box-size tree to be planted at the same address and two (2) fifteen gallon-size trees to be planted elsewhere on City property. The applicant would pay all removal and replacement costs.

If approved by the Commission, the tree must be removed and mitigation trees provided to the City within one year from the date of final approval, after which the approval expires.

### **FISCAL REVIEW**

There would be no fiscal impact to the City if the request to remove the tree is either denied or approved as a Category 3 - Discretionary Removal, as the Applicant would pay all costs.

For the Commission's information, the cost for the removal of the tree would be \$280. The replanting costs for the mitigation trees (1 – 24" box size and 2 – 15 gallon size) would be \$425. Total cost for removal and replacement would be \$705. Costs are based on current City contract prices. The estimated value of the tree is \$3,260.

### **LEGAL REVIEW**

No legal review is required for this item.

### **CONCLUSION**

The City-owned parkway tree that is being requested to be removed is located in the public right-of-way in the front parkway of 2059 Flamingo Drive. The Applicant is requesting removal of this tree due to the problems associated with its root system and several other inconveniences associated with the tree. The Applicant has stated over the phone (but not in the letter submitted to Public Services) that they do not feel they should have to pay for the removal and replacement costs. This is the main reason that the matter is being brought before the Parks and Recreation Commission.

The tree removal request does meet the criteria required for staff approval, but not at City cost and not without the required replacement costs required in satisfying the criteria set forth by Section 4. 0.2 – Accelerated Removals as defined in the Streetscape and Median Development Standards. The City Arborist determined that the tree is in good condition, and therefore staff recommends that the Commission deny the request to have the tree removed at the expense of the City.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
BRUCE A. HARTLEY  
Maintenance Services Manager

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
ERNESTO MUNOZ  
Public Services Director

- ATTACHMENTS:   1. Letter from Applicant  
                      2. Tree Information and Photographs

C:     Janis Schonauer  
       2059 Flamingo Drive  
       Costa Mesa, CA 92626

Bruce Hartley  
Maintenance Services Manager  
City of Costa Mesa, CA

September 30, 2014



RE: Removal of *Cupaniopsis anacardioides* at 2059 Flamingo Drive

Dear Mr. Hartley,

I am asking the Parks and Recreation Commission to approve removal of the *Cupaniopsis anacardioides* (Carrot Wood) tree from the parkway at 2059 Flamingo Drive as a Category 4 - 0.3 Discretionary Removal.

The attached photographs demonstrate:

1. The tree roots have occupied all the soil in the parkway strip. This invasion makes it extremely difficult to grow any other plants in the parkway. (Photo 1)
2. The roots have spread into the front lawn and require regular removal of suckers.
3. The tree is categorized by the City as a "Problem Tree Species" it is only a matter of time before it will break the sidewalk or curb. The sidewalk immediately in front of the tree has been shaved down to reduce the upheaval it has already caused. (Photo 2)
4. The tree sheds copious amounts of hard seeds and seed pods which litter the sidewalk. The walk is swept regularly but it is not possible to keep the sidewalk free of debris.
5. My neighbor Gary Kempinsky, who resides at 2060 Goldeneye, travels around the block twice each day in his wheel chair. The pods seriously impede his ability to continue his journey around the block, and on more than one occasion he has struggled to remove seed pods which became embedded in his wheelchair tires.

For these reasons I ask the Commission to remove it as a Category 4.0.3 Discretionary Removal.

Thank you for your consideration of this request.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
James Schonauer  
2059 Flamingo Drive  
Costa Mesa, CA 92626

~~XXXXXXXXXX~~

attachments:photos

Cam



City of Costa Mesa  
Maintenance Services Division  
FIELD INSPECTION – TREE INFORMATION

ATTACHMENT #2

Date Request Received: 09/11/2014  
Name of Resident: Janis Schonauer Requesting Party: \_\_\_\_\_  
Address: 2059 Flamingo Drive Address: \_\_\_\_\_  
Home Phone: \_\_\_\_\_ Home Phone: \_\_\_\_\_  
Work Phone: \_\_\_\_\_ Work Phone: \_\_\_\_\_

Date Inspected: 10/03/2014  
Inspected By: Doug Kokesh - City Arborist  
Parkway Maintenance Report:

Tree Species: Cupaniopsis anacardiodes Removal Cost: (DBH x \$20.00)= \$ 280.00  
Height: 25 Feet Width of Sidewalk: 4 Feet  
Trunk Diameter: 14 Inches Size of Right-of-Way: 10 Feet

Health: Good  Fair  Poor  Date of Last Pruning: 05/01/2012

Is the Tree a good candidate for Relocation? Yes  No

Likelihood of survival: Good  Fair  Poor

Comments: **Cupaniopsis anacardiodes of this size typically do not transplant well. The cost of transplanting will likely exceed the \$3,260 Arbor Access stated value of this tree.**

Concrete Damage: Yes  No

If Yes, describe damage: **Three sidewalk grinds have been completed at this location in the past. There are no current trip hazards.**

Can the Tree be Root Pruned: Yes  No  Date: within 30 days

Root Pruning Comments: **Root pruning will not address the issues as addressed in the owner's statement. Root pruning along the sidewalk, however, may slow subsequent hardscape uplift occurrences.**

Date of Response to Resident: \_\_\_\_\_

Date Information Packet Mailed: \_\_\_\_\_

Photos Taken: Yes  No  Date Photos Taken: 10/03/2014

Photo #1: Street view looking southwest

Photo #2: Street view looking southeast

Photo #3: Street view looking east

Photo #4: Base of the tree

| <b>Site Detail</b> (33.671907029492,-117.94286061432) |                  |                                      |  |              |              |
|---|------------------|--------------------------------------|--|--------------|--------------|
| District  | Address          | Location                             | Species  | DBH          | Height       |
| 16  | 2059 FLAMINGO DR | Front-1                              | <i>Cupaniopsis anacardioides</i><br>CARROTWOOD | 13-18        | 15-30        |
| Condition   | Maintenance      | Removal Priority                     | Estimated Value                                | Parkway Type | Parkway Size |
| Good  | Grid Trim        | N/A                                  | \$3,260  | Parkway      | 5            |
| Utility   | Valid            |                                      |  |              |              |
| No  | Yes              |                                      |  |              |              |
| <b>Work History</b>                                   |                  |                                      |  |              |              |
| Crew  | Work Date        | Work Type                            | Job #/Acct #                                   | Amount       |              |
| WCA   | 5/1/2012         | Grid Pruning                         | 19252  | \$46.60      |              |
| WCA   | 7/6/2009         | Grid Pruning                         | 14385  | \$46.60      |              |
| WCA   | 10/10/2007       | Grid Pruning                         | 11049  | \$45.10      |              |
| WCA   | 3/23/2004        | Grid Trimming                        | 6173   | \$41.50      |              |
| WCA   | 11/26/2003       | <u>Rt Prune &amp; 12" RB Instal.</u> | 5753   | \$112.00     |              |
| WCA   | 5/10/2001        | Grid Trimming                        | 3569   | \$40.10      |              |

**Parkway Maintenance Program**  
Resident Complaint Tracking System

| Record Nr. | Received   | Addr. | Street Name | Work Order | Area |
|------------|------------|-------|-------------|------------|------|
| 15293      | 09/04/2013 | 2059  | FLAMINGO DR |            | 0    |

**Complaint**

PREVENTATIVE MAINTENANCE BY CONTRACT WITH CENTRAL COAST SURFACE GRINDING.

Help on addi

|             |   |
|-------------|---|
| Add Photo 1 | S |
| Add photo 2 | S |

**DAMAGE**

| Sidewalk Sq-Ft | C and G Lin-Ft | Dwy Sq-Ft | Spandrel X-Gutter Sq-Ft | Completed |
|----------------|----------------|-----------|-------------------------|-----------|
|                |                |           |                         |           |

  

| Trees Nr | Grind Ht-In | Ramp Ht-In | Photo                    | Date Notified | Notified By | Status |
|----------|-------------|------------|--------------------------|---------------|-------------|--------|
|          |             |            | <input type="checkbox"/> |               |             |        |

**Comments**

GROUND 3 LOCATIONS, 12 LINEAR FEET, 0.5-1.0".





