



# **PARKS AND RECREATION COMMISSION AGENDA REPORT**

---

MEETING DATE: FEBRUARY 26, 2015

ITEM NUMBER:

**SUBJECT: TREE REMOVAL REQUEST - 3050 MADISON AVENUE**

**DATE: FEBRUARY 12, 2015**

**FROM: PUBLIC SERVICES DEPARTMENT, MAINTENANCE SERVICES DIVISION**

**PRESENTATION BY: BRUCE A. HARTLEY, MAINTENANCE SERVICES MANAGER**

**FOR FURTHER INFORMATION CONTACT: BRUCE A. HARTLEY (714) 754-5123**

---

## **RECOMMENDATION**

Deny the request for the removal of one City-owned parkway tree (Tree #F-1) located in the public right-of-way at 3050 Madison Avenue.

## **BACKGROUND**

The Maintenance Services Division was initially contacted by the Applicant on March 26, 2013, requesting the City remove one tree located in front and two trees located on the side of the property due to the nuisance of the year-round pine needles, excessive pollen, concrete damage and sewer issues.

At the meeting of August 22, 2013, the Commission approved the Discretionary Removal of parkway trees #S-2 and #S-3 located in the public right-of-way along Paularino Avenue. The request to remove Tree #1 in the public right-of-way directly in front of the home was denied. The Applicant paid for the removal of the two trees approved for removal and for the cost of the 3:1 replanting requirements. The trees were removed and the replacement trees planted in October 2013.

In January 2014 the Applicant again requested, via letter, the removal of the remaining parkway Canary Island Pine tree. The Maintenance Services Division responded with a letter informing the Applicant that the Commission's decision could not be reheard for one year from the date of the August 22, 2013 meeting.

In a letter dated November 6, 2014, (See Attachment 1) the Applicant requested that the Maintenance Services Manager remove the tree. The justification for the request was that roots from the City tree were causing the sewer line to back up. The Applicant stated that when the plumber removed the toilet to access the drain line, he found roots wrapped around the pipe. The Applicant has not provided invoices or video documentation to support the removal request.

The Applicant was notified via telephone that the request would be agendized for the February 2015 meeting.

## **ANALYSIS**

The tree being requested for removal is a Canary Island Pine tree, *Pinus canariensis*. The tree is over sixty feet (60') in height with a trunk diameter of twenty-three inches (23"). It is in good condition. The tree is growing in a five and one-half foot (5.5') wide parkway adjacent to a four foot (4') wide sidewalk. The tree has been pruned seven (7) times in the past twelve (12) years in an attempt to satisfy the property owner and mitigate the impacts of the tree. See Attachment 2. The sidewalk has been repaired. There are currently no lifted areas as a result of this tree.

The Arborist confirmed that the tree still does not meet the criteria for a staff level authorization for removal (Category 1 or 2 removal), as stated in the Streetscape and Median Development Standards. The City Arborist evaluated the tree for possible relocation, but believes that due to the size and cost of relocating the tree, relocation is not recommended.

Other than the nuisance issues related to the pine needles, pollen and sap, there are no significant impacts being caused by this tree. An evaluation of the private property revealed many mature plants with the capability of being the source of the roots found by the plumber. It is highly unlikely that the roots of the parkway tree are impacting the sewer under the home as the tree is approximately twenty-five feet (25') from the structure. No documentation of root issues in the area of the tree were reported or documented. Several years ago, the sewer lateral was repaired in a cooperative program with the City. No records were provided by the Applicant that clarified what type of repair was performed or where the blockage occurred, so there is no way to know if there is new sewer lateral damage attributable to the tree.

The tree is tall, exceeding sixty feet. Due to its size and good health, it produces a large quantity of needles, cones, pollen and sap; all very normal for a Canary Island Pine. The tree has been maintained frequently and appropriately dating back to 2002, the limit of the City tree maintenance records. There are no observable conditions that would indicate that this tree is a risk for failure. The sidewalks and streets are in satisfactory condition.

The Applicant has been notified of the Parks and Recreation Commission meeting and has been sent a copy of this staff report.

## **ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED**

1. The Commission could authorize the removal and replacement of the tree, per the Streetscape and Median Development Standards, Section 4.0.3 – Discretionary Removals, which would require the replacement of the tree with one (1) twenty-four inch box-size tree to be planted at the same address and two (2) fifteen gallon-size trees to be planted elsewhere on City property. The applicant would pay all removal and replacement costs.

If approved by the Commission, fees must be paid, the tree removed and mitigation trees provided to the City within one year from the date of final approval, after which the approval expires.

2. The Commission could authorize the removal of the tree as a Category 1 – 'Health and Safety' removal with all removal and replacement costs paid for by the City.

## FISCAL REVIEW

There would be no fiscal impact to the City if the request to remove the tree were either denied or approved as a Category 3; Discretionary Removal, as the applicant would pay all costs.

For the Commission's information, the cost for the removal of the tree would be \$460. The replanting costs for the mitigation trees (1 – 24" box size and 2 – 15 gallon size) would be \$425. Costs are based on current City contract prices. Total cost for removal and replacement would be \$885. The value of the tree is estimated to be approximately \$9,110.

## LEGAL REVIEW

No legal review is required for this item.

## CONCLUSION

The City-owned street tree that is being requested to be removed is located within the public right-of-way in front of 3050 Madison Avenue. The tree is in good condition and not causing any damage. The Applicant is requesting removal of the tree due to sewer problems. There is no documentation from the Applicant that provides justification for the removal. Typically, the City requires a recent video inspection of the sewer lateral with date and distance stamps on the video so that staff may determine the condition of the lateral and the cause of the sewer issue.

Lacking any evidence of damage attributable to the City tree, it is recommended that the Commission deny the request.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
BRUCE A. HARTLEY  
Maintenance Services Manager

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
ERNESTO MUNOZ  
Public Services Director

- ATTACHMENTS:
1. Letter from Applicant
  2. Tree Information
  3. Photographs

C: Suzann Cummins  
3050 Madison Avenue  
Costa Mesa, CA 92626

11-6-14

ATTACHMENT #1

To: Parks & Recreation  
Commission  
and: Bruce N. Harley:—

I hope you will  
listen to me this time.  
I really need the tree  
removed in front of my  
house at - 3050 Mission Ave.,  
Costa Mesa, 92626. My phone  
# is 714 850-1004.

A few days ago I  
had to call my plumber.  
They showed 4 toilets where  
plugged up. We removed  
one of my toilets, only to  
see branches wrapped around  
the drain.

About five-years ago  
when I started wanting to  
get the trees removed, I  
had a leak-up from the  
sewer system. Between what  
I paid & a grant from the  
City of Costa Mesa, it cost  
almost 1,000.00 dollars. I  
spent thousands of dollars

Damage done to the inside  
of my home, my insurance  
was cancelled and I almost  
had a nervous breakdown.  
At the time all this happened  
I was taking care of one  
of my sons and my husband,  
both died within few months  
of each other.

My health is not any  
better - seems to be worked  
from this tree. I want it  
out!!!

If you would like to  
contact the City of C. M. -  
The Department is: Housing  
& Community Development  
Inclusive of Neighbors -  
Neighbors for Neighbors -  
714 754-4870

My plumber:-  
E & P Plumbing  
Brian Burroughs 714 544-0004.

As I have stated  
before I have lived in  
my home since January/03,  
I have always taken good

care of my home, I have  
added artificial grass both  
front & back yards. I  
also installed a drip-irri-  
gation system to save and  
water. I love Costa Mesa  
and try to maintain my  
home, but I feel Costa  
Mesa does not love me.  
If I was your mother,  
or Grandmother I bet  
that tree would be gone!

Sincerely yours,  
Susan Maria Cummins

City of Costa Mesa  
Maintenance Services Division  
**FIELD INSPECTION – TREE INFORMATION**

ATTACHMENT #2

Denial	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Category	1 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	2 <input type="checkbox"/>	3 <input type="checkbox"/>
Supporting	<input type="checkbox"/>	Category	1 <input type="checkbox"/>	2 <input type="checkbox"/>	3 <input type="checkbox"/>

Date Request Received: **11/06/2014**

Name of Resident: **Suzann Cummins** Requesting Party: \_\_\_\_\_  
Address: **3050 Madison Ave F1** Address: \_\_\_\_\_  
Home Phone: **[REDACTED]** Home Phone: \_\_\_\_\_  
Work Phone: \_\_\_\_\_ Work Phone: \_\_\_\_\_

Date Inspected: **7/18/13**

Inspected By: **Daniel Dominguez III – Interim City Arborist**

Parkway Maintenance Report:

Tree Species: **Pinus canariensis F1** Removal Cost: (DBH x \$20.00)= **\$ 460.00**  
Height: **60 Feet** Width of Sidewalk: **4 Feet**  
Trunk Diameter: **23 inches** Size of Right-of-Way: **10 Feet**

Health: Good  Fair  Poor

Date of Last Pruning: **12/8/2014**

Is the Tree a good candidate for Relocation? Yes  No

Likelihood of survival: Good  Fair  Poor

Comments: **Tree size makes boxing prohibitive. Will require a large root ball impacting curb & gutter, asphalt street, sidewalk and private block wall. Estimated value stated in Arbor Access is \$9,110.00.**

Concrete Damage: Yes  No

If Yes, describe damage: **Cracked sidewalk, no trip hazard. Sidewalk has been shaved. Cracked curb & gutter.**

Can the Tree be Root Pruned: Yes  No  Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Root Pruning Comments:

Date of Response to Resident: \_\_\_\_\_

Date Information Packet Mailed: \_\_\_\_\_

Photos Taken: Yes  No

Date Photos Taken: **7/18/2013**

Photo #1: **Street view looking east**

Photo #2: **Street view looking north**

Photo #3: **Street view looking south**

Photo #4: **Base of the tree**

<b>Site Detail</b> (33.682555607046,-117.90027032424)					
District	Address	Location	Species	DBH	Height
7	3050 MADISON AV	Front-1	<i>Pinus canariensis</i> CANARY ISLAND PINE	19-24	45-60
Condition	Maintenance	Removal Priority	Estimated Value	Parkway Type	Parkway Size
Good	Grid Trim	N/A	\$9,110	Parkway	5
Utility	Valid				
No	Yes				
<b>Work History</b>					
Crew	Work Date	Work Type	Job #/Acct #	Amount	
WCA	12/8/2014	Full Prune - Hardwood 7-24 DSH	28318	\$58.00	
WCA	4/19/2011	Grid Pruning	16780	\$46.60	
WCA	3/30/2009	Grid Pruning	12656	\$46.60	
WCA	1/9/2008	Service Request Pruning	11049	\$45.10	
WCA	5/4/2006	Prune Backup - Crew	8470		
WCA	7/1/2005	Grid Pruning	8470	\$41.50	
WCA	3/26/2002	Grid Trimming	4219	\$41.50	
<b>Notes</b>					







