PARKS AND RECREATION COMMISSION AGENDA REPORT

MEETING DATE: OCTOBER 22, 2015 **ITEM NUMBER: 8a**

SUBJECT: TREE REMOVAL REQUEST - 954 GOVERNOR STREET

DATE: OCTOBER 7, 2015

FROM: PUBLIC SERVICES DEPARTMENT, MAINTENANCE SERVICES DIVISION

PRESENTATION BY: BRUCE A. HARTLEY, MAINTENANCE SERVICES MANAGER

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION CONTACT: BRUCE A. HARTLEY (714) 754-5123

RECOMMENDATION

Deny the request to remove one (1) City owned parkway tree growing in the public right-of-way at 954 Governor Street at City expense.

BACKGROUND

The Maintenance Services Division was initially contacted by the Applicant via visitation to the City Corporation Yard on July 17, 2015, stating that they would like to remove the tree that is planted in their front lawn due to excessive fruit.

On July 20, 2015 the Acting City Arborist inspected the tree and evaluated the reported problems associated with the tree. No noticeable fruit was visible at the time of the inspection. There were no other significant issues observed. The tree did not meet the criteria to be removed by the City at no cost to the Applicant (Category 1 – Health and Safety Removal). However, the Carrotwood tree is considered by the City to be a "problem tree species" and could be removed by the City at the expense of the adjacent homeowner if so desired (Category 2 – Accelerated Removal).

On July 21, 2015, the Acting City Arborists contacted the resident and explained the three tree removal categories. The Applicant did not wish to pay the cost for the removal of the tree and subsequently requested to have the removal agendized for consideration by the Parks and Recreation Commission. The Applicant submitted a letter requesting removal dated July 27, 2015. See Attachment 1. The main issue the Applicant sites in the letter is the heavy fruiting, low hanging branches and the mess on the street and private property.

ANALYSIS

The tree is a Carrotwood, *Cupaniopsis anacardiodes*. The tree was found to be in good health with no apparent structural issues or diseases present. The tree is approximately twenty-feet (20') in height with a trunk diameter of ten inches (10"). It is growing in a ten foot (10') public right-of-way with no sidewalk. The tree has the appearance of growing in the Applicant's front lawn. The tree has been maintained by the City on a consistent 3-4 year cycle and that the tree was last trimmed on August 22, 2011. See Attachment 2.

There was no fruit present on the front lawn at the time of the inspection. Typically, Carrotwood trees fruit quite heavily for approximately two to three months in early summer and then the fruit is not as plentiful or is absent the remaining months of the year.

The tree is not a risk to health and safety, is not dead, diseased or dying and does not appear to be creating any significant exposure to liability for the City. The tree meets the criteria for a staff level authorization for removal, as stated in the Streetscape and Median Development Standards, however only as a Category 2 – Accelerated removal, which is at the Applicant's expense. The City Arborist evaluated the tree for possible relocation, but believes due to the size, low probability of success and the cost of relocating the tree, relocation is not recommended.

The Applicant has been notified of the Parks and Recreation Commission meeting and has been sent a copy of this staff report.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED

1. The Commission could authorize the removal of the tree as a Category 1 – 'Health and Safety' removal with all removal and replacement costs paid for by the City and determine if a replacement tree is to be planted.

2. The Commission could authorize the removal and replacement of the tree, per the Streetscape and Median Development Standards, Section 4.0.2 Category 2 – Accelerated Removals, which would require the replacement of the tree with one (1) twenty-four inch box-size tree and two (2) fifteen gallon-size trees to be planted elsewhere on City property. The applicant would pay all removal and replacement costs.

   If the tree removal is approved by the Commission, the payment for the removal of the parkway tree and any required mitigation trees must be provided to the City prior to removal and within one year from the date of final approval, after which the approval expires.

FISCAL REVIEW

There would be no fiscal impact to the City if the request to remove the tree was denied, or approved as a Category 2 - Accelerated Removal, as the Applicant would pay all costs.

For the Commission's information, removal cost for this tree would be $150. The replanting costs for the mitigation trees (1 – 24" box size and 2 – 15 gallon container size) would be $425. Costs are based on current City contract prices. The total cost for removal and replacement would be $575.

If approved as a Category 1 – Health and Safety Removal, the cost to the City for the removal would be $150; with a cost of $225 for the installation of one 24" box-size replacement tree. Total cost would be $375.

The value of the tree is estimated to be $1,380.

LEGAL REVIEW

No legal review is required for this item.

CONCLUSION

The City-owned tree that has been requested to be removed at City expense is located in the public right-of-way at 954 Governor Street. The tree is in good condition, has been maintained appropriately on a regular schedule and is not causing any damage to vital infrastructure; it does not meet the criteria for a 'no-cost' removal. However, the tree is considered a "Problem Tree Species" and may be removed at the expense of the adjacent property owner with 3:1 tree replacement required.

It is recommended that the Commission deny the request to have the City incur the removal and replacement cost.

Bruce A. Hartley
BRUCE A. HARTLEY
Maintenance Services Manager

ERNESTO MUNOZ
Public Services Director

ATTACHMENTS:
1. Letter From Resident
2. Tree Information & Maintenance History
3. Photographs

C: Hennie van Doorn
954 Governor Street
Costa Mesa, CA 92627

ATTACHMENT #1

RECEIVED AUG 03 2015

July 27, 2015

Dear Mr. Hartley,

I have lived in my house on 954 Governor Street since October 1965 and over the years my husband and I have remodeled the house inside and out. I believe that I have the nicest yard with the most curb appeal on the block, but the tree the city planted has become a nuisance and created a mess.

It was a slow growing tree that has not been much of a problem until this year. The tree has bore so much fruit the branches are hanging low onto peoples cars and little kids could pick the berries off by hand. It also created a terrible mess on the street and in my yard. The cars that park beneath the tree become covered in the little berries. Even the street sweeper went around the mess on the street as he didn't want to break his mirrors on the low hanging branches, so the berries on the street were never picked up and peoples tires have been spreading these berries throughout the neighborhood.

This is not the right tree for a neighborhood, it is better suited for a park and I would love to see the tree removed from my yard and replanted. Unfortunately, I cannot afford to remove the tree as I am on a fixed income.

So I put the question to you, can I prune and trim the tree myself? Or do I have to wait for the city to come and do it?

Thank you for your time and consideration regarding this matter. I look forward to hearing your response.

Sincerely,

Hennie van Doorn

Hennie van Doorn
954 Governor Street, Costa Mesa, CA 92627
[redacted]

City of Costa Mesa
Maintenance Services Division
FIELD INSPECTION – TREE INFORMATION

ATTACHMENT #2

Date Request Received: **July 20, 2015**
Name of Resident: **Hennie van Doorn** Requesting Party: **Same**
Address: **954 Governor Street** Address:

Date Inspected: **July 20, 2015**
Inspected By: **Jim Ortiz**

Tree Species: **Carrotwood** Removal Cost: (DBH x $ 15.00)= $ **150.00**
Height: **20 Feet** Width of Sidewalk: **No Sidewalk**
Trunk Diameter: **10 Inches** Size of Right-of-Way: **10'**

Health: Good☒ Fair☐ Poor☐ Date of Last Pruning: **8/22/11**

Is the Tree a good candidate for Relocation? Yes☐ No☒

Likelihood of survival: Good☐ Fair☐ Poor☒

Comments: **This tree is a "problem tree species"**

Concrete Damage: Yes☐ No☒

If Yes, describe damage:

Can the Tree be Root Pruned: Yes☒ No☐ Date: _____

Root Pruning Comments: **Tree evaluated. Recommendation is to root prune and add 18" root barriers.**

Date of Response to Resident: **July 21, 2015**

Date Information Packet Mailed: **Hand delivered 7/23/15**

Photos Taken: Yes☒ No☐ Date Photos Taken: 7/20/15

Photo #1: **Street view looking west**
Photo #2: **Street view looking east**
Photo #3: **Street view looking at tree**
Photo #4: **Base of tree**

Site Detail (33.653193323232,-117.9387176755)

District	Address	Location	Species	DBH	Height
18	954 GOVERNOR ST	Front-1	*Cupaniopsis anacardioides* CARROTWOOD	07-12	15-30

Condition	Maintenance	Removal Priority	Estimated Value	Parkway Type	Parkway Size
Good	Grid Trim	N/A	$1,380	Curb/Gutter	99

Utility	Valid
No	Yes

Work History

Crew	Work Date	Work Type	Job #/Acct #	Amount
WCA	8/22/2011	Grid Pruning	19252	$46.60
WCA	12/31/2008	Grid Pruning	12656	$46.60
WCA	1/19/2006	Grid Pruning	8470	$41.50
WCA	8/2/2002	Grid Trimming	5259	$41.50

Notes

6

ATTACHMENT #3

6

10