



PARKS AND RECREATION COMMISSION AGENDA REPORT

MEETING DATE: MARCH 24, 2016

ITEM NUMBER: **8e**

SUBJECT: TREE REMOVAL REQUEST - 1883 MAUI CIRCLE

DATE: MARCH 11, 2016

FROM: PUBLIC SERVICES DEPARTMENT, MAINTENANCE SERVICES DIVISION

PRESENTATION BY: BRUCE A. HARTLEY, MAINTENANCE SERVICES MANAGER

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION CONTACT: BRUCE A. HARTLEY (714) 754-5123

RECOMMENDATION

Deny the request to remove one (1) City owned parkway tree growing in the public right-of-way at 1883 Maui Circle at City expense.

BACKGROUND

The Maintenance Services Division was initially contacted by the Applicant via phone call on June 9, 2014, requesting that the City Arborist look at the roots of the tree. That same day, the City Arborist evaluated the tree and informed the resident that the tree would be root pruned and that root barriers would be installed. The work was completed on September 3, 2014, by West Coast Arborists, Inc., the City's tree maintenance contractor.

The Maintenance Services Division was again contacted by the Applicant on February 17, 2016, expressing concerns about roots causing major problems to the sidewalk. On February 23, 2016, the City Arborist inspected the tree and evaluated the reported problems associated with the tree. It was noted that there were no issues with the sidewalk at 1883 Maui Circle, but there were two areas of raised sidewalk of approximately 3/8" next door at 1881 Maui Circle. Those were ground that same day. Additionally, two exposed roots approximately 1.5 to 2 inches in diameter were observed in the parkway of 1883. Those roots, which appear to have been hit and severed by a lawnmower, were cut and removed to mitigate the reported trip hazard.

The City Arborist and Maintenance Services Manager conducted a field visit and determined that the tree did not meet the criteria to be removed by the City as a Category 1 – Health and Safety Removal. The Arborist informed the resident that if desired, the tree removal request could be agendized for consideration by the next Parks and Recreation Commission at their next meeting. The Applicant submitted a written request, received February 24, 2016, formalizing the complaints of concrete damage and the trip hazards; requesting that the tree be removed. See Attachment 1.

ANALYSIS

The tree is a Fern Pine, *Afrocanthus gracilior*. The tree is in good health with no apparent structural issues or diseases present. The tree is approximately twenty-five feet (25') in height with a trunk diameter of fifteen and one-half inches (15.5"). It is growing in a five

and one-half foot (5.5') wide turf parkway adjacent to a four foot (4') wide sidewalk. The tree has been maintained by the City on a consistent 3-4 year cycle and was last trimmed on March 29, 2012. See Attachments 2 and 3.

The tree is not a risk to health and safety, is not dead, diseased or dying and does not appear to be creating any significant exposure to liability for the City. The tree meets the criteria for a staff level authorization for removal, as stated in the Streetscape and Median Development Standards, however only as a Category 3 – Discretionary removal, which is at the City's expense and can only be determined to be removed by the Parks and Recreation Commission. The City Arborist evaluated the tree for possible relocation, but believes due to the size, low probability of success and the cost of relocating the tree, relocation is not recommended.

The Applicant has been notified of the Parks and Recreation Commission meeting and has been sent a copy of this staff report.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED

1. The Commission could authorize the removal of the tree as a Category 1 – 'Health and Safety' removal with all removal and replacement costs paid for by the City and determine if a replacement tree is to be planted.
2. The Commission could authorize the removal and replacement of the tree, per the Streetscape and Median Development Standards, Section 4.0.2 Category 2 – Accelerated Removals or Section 4.0.3 Category 3 – Convenience Removals, which would require the replacement of the tree with one (1) twenty-four inch box-size tree and two (2) fifteen gallon-size trees to be planted elsewhere on City property. The applicant would pay all removal and replacement costs.

If the tree removal is approved by the Commission, the payment for the removal of the parkway tree and any required mitigation trees must be provided to the City prior to removal and within one year from the date of final approval, after which the approval expires.

FISCAL REVIEW

There would be no fiscal impact to the City if the request to remove the tree was denied, or approved as a Category 2 - Accelerated Removal or Section 4.0.3 Category 3 – Convenience Removal, as the Applicant would pay all costs.

For the Commission's information, removal cost for this tree would be \$310. The replanting costs for the mitigation trees (1 – 24" box size and 2 – 15 gallon container size) would be \$425. Costs are based on current City contract prices. The total cost for removal and replacement would be \$735.

If approved as a Category 1 – Health and Safety Removal, the cost to the City for the removal would be \$310; with a cost of \$225 for the installation of one 24" box-size replacement tree. Total cost would be \$535.

The value of the tree is estimated to be \$1,380.

LEGAL REVIEW

No legal review is required for this item.

CONCLUSION

The City-owned tree that has been requested to be removed at City expense is located in the public right-of-way at 1883 Maui Circle. The tree is in good condition, has been maintained appropriately on a regular schedule. The minor damage it was causing to the public sidewalk has been addressed; the protruding roots have been removed and the seasonal fruit, while a nuisance, is not of sufficient quantity or risk to warrant the removal of this parkway tree. It is recommended that the Commission deny the request to have the City incur the removal and replacement cost.


BRUCE A. HARTLEY
Maintenance Services Manager


ERNESTO MUNOZ
Public Services Director

ATTACHMENTS:

1. Letter from Resident
2. Tree information
3. Maintenance History
4. Photographs

C: Ilene Moritz
1883 Maui Circle
Costa Mesa, CA 92626

Ilene Moritz
1883 Maui Circle
Costa Mesa, CA 92626

Lilian Long
1881 Maui Circle
Costa Mesa

February 22, 2016

Attn: B. Hartley
Bruce Hartley
P.O. Box 1200
Costa Mesa, CA 92628-1200

RECEIVED
FEB 24 2016

Re: City of Costa Mesa Trees/Roots Sticking up/Raising the Sidewalks

Dear Mr. Hartley:

I need to bring to your attention the fact that the City of Costa Mesa has trees in front of my property and also the other property listed above for Ms. Lilian Long, that are causing problems with our properties and our safety.

Please note when the City came out and trimmed their trees, they left open roots that have raised the sidewalks and almost caused me to fall. My shoe caught on one of the roots, as I started to fall, my husband caught me. This needs to be taken care of immediately. Otherwise, someone is going to seriously hurt themselves, hitting their head and falling. This is not good. We need to have this addressed right now.

At this point in time, we just need to have both trees removed. In addition, the fruit that is on those trees is falling on the sidewalk that could cause someone to slip and fall. If you are standing under the tree, the fruit falls and hits you on the head. This could cause serious damage to children that may be playing near the trees and someone could seriously slip and fall and really get hurt.

*you can reach me at [REDACTED] ✓
or Email me at [REDACTED]
Sincerely Ilene Moritz (thank you)*

City of Costa Mesa
Maintenance Services Division
FIELD INSPECTION – TREE INFORMATION

ATTACHMENT #2

Date Request Received: February 24, 2016
Name of Resident: Ilene Moritz Requesting Party: Same
Address: 1883 Maui Circle Address: Same

Date Inspected: March 8, 2016
Inspected By: Jim Ortiz

Tree Species: Fern Pine Removal Cost: (DBH x \$ 20.00)= \$ 310.00
Height: 25 Feet Width of Sidewalk: 4 Feet
Trunk Diameter: 15.50 Inches Size of Right-of-Way: 10 Feet

Health: Good Fair Poor Date of Last Pruning: 3/29/12

Is the Tree a good candidate for Relocation? Yes No

Likelihood of survival: Good Fair Poor

Comments:

Concrete Damage: Yes No

If Yes, describe damage: **4 areas cracked on curb and 1 area separated on curb. No damage to sidewalk.**

Can the Tree be Root Pruned: Yes No Date: 9/3/2014

Root Pruning Comments: **Tree has already been root pruned.**

Date of Response to Resident: _____

Date Information Packet Mailed: _____

Photos Taken: Yes No Date Photos Taken: 3/08/16

Photo #1: **Front of Tree**

Photo #2: **Looking North**

Photo #3: **Looking South**

Photo #4: **Back of Tree**

Site Detail (33.679578133311,-117.93458632296)(WCA InventoryID: 1825710)					
District	Address	Location	Species	DBH	Height
10	1883 MAUI CIR	Front-1	<i>Afrocarpus gracillior</i> FERN PINE	07-12	15-30
Condition	Maintenance	Removal Priority	Estimated Value	Parkway Type	Parkway Size
Good	Grid Trim	N/A	\$1,380	Parkway	5
Utility	Valid				
No	Yes				
Work History					
Crew	Work Date	Work Type	Job #/Acct #	Amount	
WCA	9/3/2014	Root Prune/12" RB Installation	28318	\$70.00	
WCA	3/29/2012	Grid Pruning	19252	\$46.60	
WCA	6/19/2009	Grid Pruning	12656	\$46.60	
WCA	9/19/2007	Grid Pruning	11049	\$45.10	
WCA	2/23/2004	Grid Trimming	6173	\$41.50	
WCA	3/21/2001	Grid Trimming	3569	\$40.10	
Notes					

6







